



STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

September 17, 2022

Jennifer Everett

Coastal Resources Commission

Sent via email only to: Jennifer.Everett@ncdenr.gov

Re: Objection to 15A NCAC 07H .0501, .0502, .0503, .0504, .0505, .0506, .0507, .0508, .0509, .0510, .0601, .0603, .0604, and .2305; 15A NCAC 07I .0406, .0504, .0506, .0508, .0511, .0602, and .0702; 15A NCAC 07J .0203, .0204, .0206, .0207, .0208, .0210, and .0312; 15A NCAC 07M .0201, .0202, .0401, .0402, .0403, .0503, .0601, .0603, .0701, .0703, .0704, .0801, .0802, .1001, .1002, .1101, .1102, .1201, and .1202.

Dear Ms. Everett:

At its meeting on September 15, 2022, the Rules Review Commission objected to the above-captioned rules in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.10. Please see the attached staff opinions, which are hereby incorporated by reference.

The Commission objected to 07H .0501, 07H .0502, 07H .0503, 07H .0504, 07H .0505, 07H .0506, 07H .0507, 07H .0508, 07H .0509, 07H .0510, 07H .0601, 07H .0603, 07H .0604, 07J .0203, 07M .0201, 07M .0202, 07M .0401, 07M .0403, 07M .0503, 07M .0701, 07M .0801, 07M .0802, 07M .1001, 07M .1101, 07M .1201, and 07M .1202 for lack of statutory authority pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(1), ambiguity pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(2), on the basis that the rule was not reasonably necessary pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(3), and for failure to comply with Part 2 of Article 2A of the Administrative Procedure Act pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(4).

The Commission objected to 07I .0504, 07I .0508, 07I .0511, 07I .0602, 07I .0702, 07J .0207, 07J .0208, and 07J .0312 for lack of statutory authority, pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(1).

The Commission objected to 07M .0704 and 07M .1002 for lack of statutory authority pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(1) and ambiguity pursuant to 150B-21.9(2).

Donald R. van der Vaart, Director
Chief Administrative Law Judge

Fred G. Morrison, Jr.
Senior Administrative Law Judge

An Equal Employment Opportunity Employer

1711 New Hope Church Road, Raleigh, NC 27609
Telephone: (984) 236-1850 | Facsimile: (984) 236-1871
www.oah.nc.gov

The Commission objected to 07H .2305, 07J .0210, 07M .0402, 07M .0601, 07M .0603, and 07M .0703 for ambiguity pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(2).

The Commission objected to 07J .0206 for lack of statutory authority pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(1), ambiguity pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(2), and on the basis that the rule was not reasonably necessary pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(3).

The Commission objected to 07I .0406 and 07I .0506 on the basis that the rules were not reasonably necessary pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(3).

The Commission objected to 07J .0204 and 07M .1102 for ambiguity pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(2), and for failure to comply with Part 2 of Article 2A of the Administrative Procedure Act pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(4).

Please respond to these objections in accordance with the provisions of G.S. 150B-21.12.

If you have any questions regarding the Commission's actions, please let us know.

Sincerely,

/s/William Peaslee

/s/Brian Liebman

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "James L. Cook".

Commission Counsel

Cc: Mike Lopazanski, Coastal Resources Commission
Mary Lucasse, NCDOJ

Attachments

Donald R. van der Vaart, Director
Chief Administrative Law Judge

Fred G. Morrison, Jr.
Senior Administrative Law Judge

An Equal Employment Opportunity Employer
1711 New Hope Church Road, Raleigh, NC 27609
Telephone: (984) 236-1850 | Facsimile: (984) 236-1871
www.oah.nc.gov

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07H .0501, 15A NCAC 07H .0502, 15A NCAC 07H .0503, 15A NCAC 07H .0504, 15A NCAC 07H .0505, 15A NCAC 07H .0506, 15A NCAC 07H .0507, 15A NCAC 07H .0509, and 15A NCAC 07H .0510 (Liebman); 15A NCAC 07M .0201; 15A NCAC 07M.0202; 15A NCAC 07M 0401; 15A NCAC 07M.0701; 15A NCAC 07M, .0801, 15A NCAC 07M.0802; 15A NCAC 07M .1001; and 15A NCAC 07M .1101 (Peaslee).

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

*G.S. 150B-19.1(a)(1) states, "An agency may adopt only **rules (emphasis added)** that are expressively authorized by federal and State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest."*

Each of the above captioned Rules do not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, each of the above captioned Rules do not meet the definition of a "Rule" pursuant to G.S.150B-2(8a).

As each of the above captioned rules fail to meet the definition of a "Rule", the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt them.

The adoption of each of the above captioned Rules is not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S.150B as only "Rules" can be adopted. Lastly, as each of the above captioned Rules is not a "Rule" it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

Brian Liebman & William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

Assuming arguendo that that one or more of the above captioned Rules meets the definition of a "Rule", each of the above captioned Rules, as written, is unclear and ambiguous, pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

Accordingly, staff counsel recommends that the Rules Review Commission object to 15A NCAC 07H .0501, 15A NCAC 07H .0502, 15A NCAC 07H .0503, 15A NCAC 07H .0504, 15A NCAC 07H .0505, 15A NCAC 07H .0506, 15A NCAC 07H .0507, 15A NCAC 07H .0509, 15A NCAC 07H .0510; 15A NCAC 07M .0201, 15A NCAC 07M .0202, 15A NCAC 07M .0401, 15A NCAC 07M.0701, 15A NCAC 07M .0801, 15A NCAC 07M .0802, 15A NCAC 07M .1001, AND 15A NCAC 07M .1101.

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
- a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-19.1. Requirements for agencies in the rule-making process.

(a) In developing and drafting rules for adoption in accordance with this Article, agencies shall adhere to the following principles:

- (1) An agency may adopt only rules that are expressly authorized by federal or State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest.
- (2) An agency shall seek to reduce the burden upon those persons or entities who must comply with the rule.
- (3) Rules shall be written in a clear and unambiguous manner and must be reasonably necessary to implement or interpret federal or State law.
- (4) An agency shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed. The agency shall not adopt a rule that is unnecessary or redundant.
- (5) When appropriate, rules shall be based on sound, reasonably available scientific, technical, economic, and other relevant information. Agencies shall include a reference to this information in the notice of text required by G.S. 150B-21.2(c).
- (6) Rules shall be designed to achieve the regulatory objective in a cost-effective and timely manner.

(b) Each agency subject to this Article shall conduct an annual review of its rules to identify existing rules that are unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent with the principles set forth in subsection (a) of this section. The agency shall repeal any rule identified by this review.

(c) Each agency subject to this Article shall post on its Web site, no later than the publication date of the notice of text in the North Carolina Register, all of the following:

- (1) The text of a proposed rule.
- (2) An explanation of the proposed rule and the reason for the proposed rule.
- (3) The federal certification required by subsection (g) of this section.

- (4) Instructions on how and where to submit oral or written comments on the proposed rule, including a description of the procedure by which a person can object to a proposed rule and subject the proposed rule to legislative review.

- (5) Any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule.

If an agency proposes any change to a rule or fiscal note prior to the date it proposes to adopt a rule, the agency shall publish the proposed change on its Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted. If an agency's staff proposes any such change to be presented to the rule-making agency, the staff shall publish the proposed change on the agency's Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted.

(d) Each agency shall determine whether its policies and programs overlap with the policies and programs of another agency. In the event two or more agencies' policies and programs overlap, the agencies shall coordinate the rules adopted by each agency to avoid unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent rules.

(e) Each agency shall quantify the costs and benefits to all parties of a proposed rule to the greatest extent possible. Prior to submission of a proposed rule for publication in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.2, the agency shall review the details of any fiscal note prepared in connection with the proposed rule and approve the fiscal note before submission.

(f) If the agency determines that a proposed rule will have a substantial economic impact as defined in G.S. 150B-21.4(b1), the agency shall consider at least two alternatives to the proposed rule. The alternatives may have been identified by the agency or by members of the public.

(g) Whenever an agency proposes a rule that is purported to implement a federal law, or required by or necessary for compliance with federal law, or on which the receipt of federal funds is conditioned, the agency shall:

- (1) Prepare a certification identifying the federal law requiring adoption of the proposed rule. The certification shall contain a statement setting forth the reasons why the proposed rule is required by federal law. If all or part of the proposed rule is not required by federal law or exceeds the requirements of federal law, then the certification shall state the reasons for that opinion.
- (2) Post the certification on the agency Web site in accordance with subsection (c) of this section.
- (3) Maintain a copy of the federal law and provide to the Office of State Budget and Management the citation to the federal law requiring or pertaining to the proposed rule.

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 2014-120, s. 6(a), effective September 18, 2014, and applicable to proposed rules published on or after that date. (2011-398, s. 2; 2012-187, s. 3; 2013-143, s. 1.1; 2014-120, s. 6(a).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07H .0601

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule states only that development within an AEC that is in violation of "any rules, regulations, or laws of the State of North Carolina or of local government in which the development takes place" is not allowed.

*Pursuant to G.S. 113A-124(c)(8), CRC may adopt "rules to implement **this article**." To the extent that this Rule seeks to enforce rules adopted under authority other than Article 7 of Chapter 113A of the General Statutes, or laws outside that Article, it is staff's opinion that the agency lacks statutory authority. As the language herein contains no limitations ("contravention or violation of **any** rules, regulations, or laws of the State of North Carolina **or of local government**"), it is staff's opinion that the Rule reaches outside the boundaries of Article 7 of Chapter 113A, and thus is outside of the statutory authority relied upon by the agency.*

As it pertains to rules, regulations, and statutes within the ambit of Article 7 of Chapter 113A, this Rule is unnecessary, as it merely repeats in a general way the more specific proscriptions pertaining to development within an AEC contained in these Rules and within Article 7.

*Finally, because the Rule does not specify what rules, regulations, or laws it seeks to enforce, and because the Rule would proscribe development that would be in "contravention **or** violation" of these rules, regulations, or laws, without articulating the difference between "contravention" and "violation," it is staff's opinion that the Rule is unclear and ambiguous.*

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07H .0601.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-19. Restrictions on what can be adopted as a rule.

An agency may not adopt a rule that does one or more of the following:

- (1) Implements or interprets a law unless that law or another law specifically authorizes the agency to do so.
- (2) Enlarges the scope of a profession, occupation, or field of endeavor for which an occupational license is required.
- (3) Imposes criminal liability or a civil penalty for an act or omission, including the violation of a rule, unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or a law declares that violation of the rule is a criminal offense or is grounds for a civil penalty.
- (4) Repeats the content of a law, a rule, or a federal regulation. A brief statement that informs the public of a requirement imposed by law does not violate this subdivision and satisfies the "reasonably necessary" standard of review set in G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3).
- (5) Establishes a fee or other charge for providing a service in fulfillment of a duty unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or the fee or other charge is for one of the following: a. A service to a State, federal, or local governmental unit. b. A copy of part or all of a State publication or other document, the cost of mailing a document, or both. c. A transcript of a public hearing. NC General Statutes - Chapter 150B 11 d. A conference, workshop, or course. e. Data processing services.
- (6) Allows the agency to waive or modify a requirement set in a rule unless a rule establishes specific guidelines the agency must follow in determining whether to waive or modify the requirement.
- (7) Repealed by Session Laws 2011-398, s. 61.2, effective July 25, 2011. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1996, 2nd Ex. Sess., c. 18, s. 7.10(a); 2011-13, s. 1; 2011-398, s. 61.2.)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07H .0603

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - X Lack of statutory authority
 - Unclear or ambiguous
 - Unnecessary
- X Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule limits development involving airspace over an AEC, and appears to attempt to incorporate a portion of the Code of Federal Regulation pertaining to minimum altitude standards. N.C. Gen. Stat. 150B-21.6 permits an agency to incorporate portions of the CFR by reference, but requires that the agency designate whether the incorporation includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material.

*In relevant part, the Rule states that future amendments "shall be deemed to be incorporated into this Rule pursuant to G.S. 150B-14(c) **unless the Commission objects within 90 days of publication of the action in the Federal Register.**" At which point, the Commission "shall initiate rulemaking proceedings on incorporation of the amendment into this Rule."*

Because this Rule creates a procedure for incorporating future amendments to the relevant portion of the CFR that deviate from those stated in G.S. 150B-21.6, and does not state where copies of the CFR can be obtained and at what cost, it is staff's opinion that this Rule fails to comply with Part 2 of Article 2 of the APA.

Moreover, to the extent that this Rule can be read to give CRC the authority to limit minimum altitudes contrary to federal law, it is staff's opinion that the agency lacks statutory authority under the provisions of the General Statutes quoted by the agency.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07H .0603.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.6. Incorporating material in a rule by reference.

An agency may incorporate the following material by reference in a rule without repeating the text of the referenced material:

- (1) Another rule or part of a rule adopted by the agency.
- (2) All or part of a code, standard, or regulation adopted by another agency, the federal government, or a generally recognized organization or association.
- (3) Repealed by Session Laws 1997-34, s. 5.

In incorporating material by reference, the agency must designate in the rule whether or not the incorporation includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. The agency can change this designation only by a subsequent rule-making proceeding. The agency must have copies of the incorporated material available for inspection and must specify in the rule both where copies of the material can be obtained and the cost on the date the rule is adopted of a copy of the material.

A statement in a rule that a rule incorporates material by reference in accordance with former G.S. 150B-14(b) is a statement that the rule does not include subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. A statement in a rule that a rule incorporates material by reference in accordance with former G.S. 150B-14(c) is a statement that the rule includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1975, 2nd Sess., c. 983, s. 64; 1981 (Reg. Sess., 1982), c. 1359, s. 5; 1983, c. 641, s. 3; c. 768, s. 19; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1987, c. 285, s. 13; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1997-34, s. 5.)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.

(4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this

determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07H .0604

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - X Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - X Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule limits development resulting in noise pollution within an AEC, and appears to attempt to incorporate by reference a report issued by the Environmental Protection Agency regarding the measurement of noise.

In staff's opinion, the text of the Rule is unclear and ambiguous as to the extent of the Rule's reach. While the Rule's first sentence governs noise associated with "airspace activity," it is unclear whether the rest of the Rule's requirements pertain to "airspace activity" or any activity whatsoever within an AEC. Moreover, critical terms used in the Rule such as "average noise," "event," or "noise impact" are not defined, creating further ambiguity as to enforcement.

Further, it is staff's opinion that the Rule does not comply with Article 2, Part 2 of Chapter 150B. While N.C. Gen. Stat. 150B-21.6 permits an agency to incorporate a "standard" adopted by the federal government by reference, the statute requires that the agency designate whether the incorporation includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material, and requires that the agency state where the material can be located and at what cost.

Because this Rule appears to incorporate the EPA report without following the procedure required by G.S. 150B-21.6, it is staff's opinion that this Rule fails to comply with Part 2 of Article 2 of the APA.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07H .0604.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.6. Incorporating material in a rule by reference.

An agency may incorporate the following material by reference in a rule without repeating the text of the referenced material:

- (1) Another rule or part of a rule adopted by the agency.
- (2) All or part of a code, **standard**, or regulation adopted by another agency, the federal government, or a generally recognized organization or association.
- (3) Repealed by Session Laws 1997-34, s. 5.

In incorporating material by reference, the agency must designate in the rule whether or not the incorporation includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. The agency can change this designation only by a subsequent rule-making proceeding. The agency must have copies of the incorporated material available for inspection and must specify in the rule both where copies of the material can be obtained and the cost on the date the rule is adopted of a copy of the material.

A statement in a rule that a rule incorporates material by reference in accordance with former G.S. 150B-14(b) is a statement that the rule does not include subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. A statement in a rule that a rule incorporates material by reference in accordance with former G.S. 150B-14(c) is a statement that the rule includes subsequent amendments and editions of the referenced material. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1975, 2nd Sess., c. 983, s. 64; 1981 (Reg. Sess., 1982), c. 1359, s. 5; 1983, c. 641, s. 3; c. 768, s. 19; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1987, c. 285, s. 13; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1997-34, s. 5.)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) **It is clear and unambiguous.**
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) **It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.**

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note.

The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0406

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - Lack of statutory authority
 - Unclear or ambiguous
- X Unnecessary
 - Failure to comply with the APA
- Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule re-states material regarding permit fees that is repeated in G.S. 113A-119.1 and in 15A NCAC 07J .0204. It is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule on the basis that it is unnecessary.

§ 150B-19. Restrictions on what can be adopted as a rule.

An agency may not adopt a rule that does one or more of the following:

- (1) Implements or interprets a law unless that law or another law specifically authorizes the agency to do so.
- (2) Enlarges the scope of a profession, occupation, or field of endeavor for which an occupational license is required.
- (3) Imposes criminal liability or a civil penalty for an act or omission, including the violation of a rule, unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or a law declares that violation of the rule is a criminal offense or is grounds for a civil penalty.
- (4) Repeats the content of a law, a rule, or a federal regulation. A brief statement that informs the public of a requirement imposed by law does not violate this subdivision and satisfies the "reasonably necessary" standard of review set in G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3).
- (5) Establishes a fee or other charge for providing a service in fulfillment of a duty unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or the fee or other charge is for one of the following: a. A service to a State, federal, or

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

local governmental unit. b. A copy of part or all of a State publication or other document, the cost of mailing a document, or both. c. A transcript of a public hearing. NC General Statutes - Chapter 150B 11 d. A conference, workshop, or course. e. Data processing services.

- (6) Allows the agency to waive or modify a requirement set in a rule unless a rule establishes specific guidelines the agency must follow in determining whether to waive or modify the requirement.
- (7) Repealed by Session Laws 2011-398, s. 61.2, effective July 25, 2011. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1996, 2nd Ex. Sess., c. 18, s. 7.10(a); 2011-13, s. 1; 2011-398, s. 61.2.)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0504

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☐ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule requires permit-letting agencies to compile and maintain records of public hearings related to proposed management plans under G.S. 113A-117.

This Rule relies on G.S. 113A-117(b) and 113A-124(c)(5) as its sources of statutory authority.

G.S. 113A-124(c)(5) has been repealed by the General Assembly. The remaining statute, G.S. 113A-117(b) is still in effect but is inapposite, as it requires public hearings and specifies the notice requirements, but is silent regarding any aspects of the record of such meetings.

As the agency has provided no other source of authority for this Rule, it is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07I .0504.

§ 113A-117. Implementation and enforcement programs.

(a) The Secretary shall develop and present to the Commission for consideration and to all cities and counties and lead regional organizations within the coastal area for comment a set of criteria for local implementation and enforcement programs. In the preparation of such criteria, the Secretary shall emphasize the necessity for the expeditious processing of permit applications. Said criteria may contain recommendations and guidelines as to the procedures to be followed in developing local implementation and enforcement programs, the scope and coverage of said programs, minimum standards to be prescribed in said programs, staffing of permit-letting agencies, permit-letting procedures, and priorities of regional or statewide concern. Within 20 months after July 1, 1974, the Commission shall adopt and transmit said criteria (with any revisions) to each coastal-area county and city that has filed an applicable letter of intent, for its guidance.

(b) The governing body of each city in the coastal area that filed an affirmative letter of intent shall adopt an implementation and enforcement plan with respect to its zoning area within 36 months after July 1, 1974. The board of commissioners of each coastal-area county that filed an affirmative letter of intent shall adopt an implementation plan with respect to portions of the county outside city zoning areas within 36 months after July 1, 1974, provided, however, that a county implementation and enforcement plan may also cover city jurisdictions for those cities within the counties that have not filed affirmative letters of intent pursuant to G.S. 113A-116. Prior to adopting the implementation and enforcement program the local governing body shall hold a public hearing at which public and private parties shall have the opportunity to present comments and views. Notice of the hearing shall be given not less than 15 days before the date of the hearing, and shall state the date, time and place of the hearing, the subject of the hearing, and the action which is to be taken. The notice shall state that copies of the proposed implementation and enforcement program are available for public inspection at the county courthouse. Any such notice shall be published at least once in one newspaper of general circulation in the county at least 15 days before the date on which the public hearing is scheduled to begin.

(c) Each coastal-area county and city shall transmit its implementation and enforcement program when adopted to the Commission for review. The Commission shall afford interested persons an opportunity to present objections and comments regarding the program, and shall review and consider each local implementation and enforcement program submitted in light of such objections and comments, the Commission's criteria and any general standards of review applicable throughout the coastal area as may be adopted by the Commission. Within 45 days after receipt of a local implementation and enforcement program the Commission shall either approve the program or notify the county or city of the specific changes that must be made in order for it to be approved. Following such changes, the program may be resubmitted in the same manner as the original program.

(d) If the Commission determines that any local government is failing to administer or enforce an approved implementation and enforcement program, it shall notify the local government in writing and shall specify the deficiencies of administration and enforcement. If the local government has not taken corrective action within 90 days of receipt of notification from the Commission, the Commission shall assume enforcement of the program until such time as the local government indicates its willingness and ability to resume administration and enforcement of the program. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 3; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1989, c. 727, s. 130.)

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules

adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.

(4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0506

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - Lack of statutory authority
 - Unclear or ambiguous
- X Unnecessary
 - Failure to comply with the APA
- Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule re-states material regarding allocation of permit-letting authority that is contained in G.S. 113A-116, 113A-118, and 113A-121. It is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule on the basis that it is unnecessary.

§ 150B-19. Restrictions on what can be adopted as a rule.

An agency may not adopt a rule that does one or more of the following:

- (1) Implements or interprets a law unless that law or another law specifically authorizes the agency to do so.
- (2) Enlarges the scope of a profession, occupation, or field of endeavor for which an occupational license is required.
- (3) Imposes criminal liability or a civil penalty for an act or omission, including the violation of a rule, unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or a law declares that violation of the rule is a criminal offense or is grounds for a civil penalty.
- (4) Repeats the content of a law, a rule, or a federal regulation. A brief statement that informs the public of a requirement imposed by law does not violate this subdivision and satisfies the "reasonably necessary" standard of review set in G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3).
- (5) Establishes a fee or other charge for providing a service in fulfillment of a duty unless a law specifically authorizes the agency to do so or the fee or other charge is for one of the following: a. A service to a State, federal, or

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

local governmental unit. b. A copy of part or all of a State publication or other document, the cost of mailing a document, or both. c. A transcript of a public hearing. NC General Statutes - Chapter 150B 11 d. A conference, workshop, or course. e. Data processing services.

- (6) Allows the agency to waive or modify a requirement set in a rule unless a rule establishes specific guidelines the agency must follow in determining whether to waive or modify the requirement.
- (7) Repealed by Session Laws 2011-398, s. 61.2, effective July 25, 2011. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1996, 2nd Ex. Sess., c. 18, s. 7.10(a); 2011-13, s. 1; 2011-398, s. 61.2.)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0508

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☐ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA
 - ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule relies on G.S. 113A-124(c)(5) as its sole source of statutory authority. This subparagraph was repealed by the General Assembly in SL 1987-827. As the agency has provided no other source of authority for this Rule, it is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

Moreover, to the extent the agency does have statutory authority for this Rule, subparagraph (e) explicitly defines agency policy. As such, this Rule does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, this Rule does not meet the definition of a "Rule" pursuant to G.S. 150B-2(8a).

To the extent that this Rule does not meet the statutory definition of a "Rule", the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt it, and the adoption of the Rule was not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S. 150-B as only "Rules" can be adopted.

Lastly, to the extent that this Rule is not a "Rule," it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07I .0508.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:

- a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
- b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
- c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
- d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
- e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
- f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
- g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
- h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.
- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.

- l.* Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0511

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☐ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule states that a local governing body shall enter into a commitment to accept a local management plan as part of the city or county's code of ordinances. In support of this Rule, the agency cites to G.S. 113A-117(c) and to 113A-124(c)(5).

G.S. 113A-117(c) discusses the process by which a city or county shall submit its implementation and enforcement program to the Commission for review and the standards and timetable for the Commission's review. It does not explicitly give the Commission the authority to require a local government to adopt particular ordinances.

G.S. 113A-124(c)(5) was repealed by the General Assembly by SL 1987-827.

As the agency has provided no other source of authority for this Rule, it is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

§ 113A-117. Implementation and enforcement programs.

(c) Each coastal-area county and city shall transmit its implementation and enforcement program when adopted to the Commission for review. The Commission shall afford interested persons an opportunity to present objections and comments regarding the program, and shall review and consider each local implementation and enforcement program submitted in light of such objections and comments, the Commission's criteria and any general standards of review applicable throughout the coastal area as may be adopted by the Commission. Within 45 days after receipt of a local implementation and enforcement program the Commission shall either approve the program or notify the county or city of the specific changes that must be made in order for it to be approved. Following such changes, the program may be resubmitted in the same manner as the original program.

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0602

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - X Lack of statutory authority
 - Unclear or ambiguous
 - Unnecessary
 - Failure to comply with the APA
- Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule relies on G.S. 113A-124(c)(5) as its sole source of statutory authority. This subparagraph was repealed by the General Assembly in SL 1987-827. As the agency has provided no other source of authority for this Rule, it is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules

adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.

(4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07I .0702

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☐ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule governs situations wherein a local permit letting agency takes action outside the scope and extent of its authority under Article 7 of Chapter 113A of the General Statutes. Pursuant to the Rule, such actions are "null, void, and of no effect." Moreover, the Rule goes on to state that "the determinations of the commission [sic] shall be binding on the local permit-letting agency as to questions of such jurisdiction.

This Rule relies on G.S. 113A-118(e), 113A-120(c), and 113A-124(c)(5) as its sources of statutory authority.

Both G.S. 113A-120(c) and 113A-124(c)(5) have been previously repealed by the General Assembly. The remaining statute, G.S. 113A-118(e) is still in effect but is inapposite, as it refers only to the siting of utility facilities for the development, generation, or transmission of energy.

As the agency has provided no other source of authority for this Rule, it is staff's opinion that RRC should object to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

Moreover, to the extent that the Rule merely repeats the well-established provision of black-letter law and case law, that government action outside the scope of statutory authority is null and void, it is staff's opinion that the Rule is unnecessary, and that RRC should object on that basis.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07I .0702.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 113A-118. Permit required.

(e) If, within the meaning of G.S. 113A-103(5)b3, the siting of any utility facility for the development, generation or transmission of energy is subject to regulation under this Article rather than by the State Utilities Commission or by other law, permits for such facilities shall be obtained from the Coastal Resources Commission rather than from the appropriate city or county.

§ 113A-120. Grant or denial of permits.

- (a) The responsible official or body shall deny an application for a permit upon finding:
- (1) In the case of coastal wetlands, that the development would contravene an order that has been or could be issued pursuant to G.S. 113-230.
 - (2) In the case of estuarine waters, that a permit for the development would be denied pursuant to G.S. 113-229(e).
 - (3) In the case of a renewable resource area, that the development will result in loss or significant reduction of continued long-range productivity that would jeopardize one or more of the water, food or fiber requirements of more than local concern identified in subdivisions a through c of G.S. 113A-113(b)(3).
 - (4) In the case of a fragile or historic area, or other area containing environmental or natural resources of more than local significance, that the development will result in major or irreversible damage to one or more of the historic, cultural, scientific, environmental or scenic values or natural systems identified in subdivisions a through h of G.S. 113A-113(b)(4).
 - (5) In the case of areas covered by G.S. 113A-113(b)(5), that the development will jeopardize the public rights or interests specified in said subdivision.
 - (6) In the case of natural hazard areas, that the development would occur in one or more of the areas identified in subdivisions a through e of G.S. 113A-113(b)(6) in such a manner as to unreasonably endanger life or property.
 - (7) In the case of areas which are or may be impacted by key facilities, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans, or would contravene any of the provisions of subdivisions (1) to (6) of this subsection.
 - (8) In any case, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans.
 - (9) In any case, that considering engineering requirements and all economic costs there is a practicable alternative that would accomplish the overall project purposes with less adverse impact on the public resources.
 - (10) In any case, that the proposed development would contribute to cumulative effects that would be inconsistent with the guidelines set forth in subdivisions (1) through (9) of this subsection. Cumulative effects are impacts attributable to the collective effects of a number of projects and include the effects of additional projects similar to the requested permit in areas available for development in the vicinity.
- (b) In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. The permit may be conditioned upon the applicant's amending his proposal to take whatever measures or agreeing to carry out

whatever terms of operation or use of the development that are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in subsection (a) of this section.

(b1) In addition to those factors set out in subsection (a) of this section, and notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (b) of this section, the responsible official or body may deny an application for a permit upon finding that an applicant, or any parent or subsidiary corporation if the applicant is a corporation:

- (1) Is conducting or has conducted any activity causing significant environmental damage for which a major development permit is required under this Article without having previously obtained such permit or has received a notice of violation with respect to any activity governed by this Article and has not complied with the notice within the time specified in the notice;
- (2) Has failed to pay a civil penalty assessed pursuant to this Article, a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article, or Article 17 of Chapter 113 of the General Statutes which is due and for which no appeal is pending;
- (3) Has been convicted of a misdemeanor pursuant to G.S. 113A-126, G.S. 113-229(k), or any criminal provision of a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article; or
- (4) Has failed to substantially comply with State rules or local ordinances and regulations adopted pursuant to this Article or with other federal and state laws, regulations, and rules for the protection of the environment.

(b2) For purposes of subsection (b1) of this section, an applicant's record may be considered for only the two years prior to the application date.

(c) Repealed by Session Laws 1989, c. 676, s. 7. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 518, ss. 4, 5; 1987, c. 827, s. 138; 1989, c. 51; c. 676, s. 7; 1997-337, s. 2; 1997-456, s. 55.2B; 1997-496, s. 2; 2000-172, s. 2.1.)

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.

(5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.

- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the

second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0203

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - X Lack of statutory authority
 - X Unclear or ambiguous
 - X Unnecessary
 - X Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule governs the preparation of plats to be submitted by an applicant for a permit under the Coastal Area Management Act ("CAMA"). The Rule contains numerous undefined key terms regarding the scope of the Rule and the requirements for a complete application which, in staff's opinion, render the Rule impermissibly unclear and ambiguous. For instance, the Rule requires that a plat be drawn to scale, but qualifies the requirement by saying that a scale of one inch to 200 feet is "normally required" without stating when such a scale would not be required.

*Additionally, significant portions of the Rule are devoted to applications for permits "that authorize projects that have a **portion** of the development **outside** Areas of Environmental Concern." According to the Rule, "**some information**" about "**development outside** AECs is necessary to determine compatibility with the local Land Use Plan and to be **reasonably** sure that such development will not **adversely impact** AECs." While the Rule goes on to specify what information should be provided, it again qualifies the enumerated list by saying that this list is the "minimum" required, suggesting that other information not included in the Rule is also required.*

*Further, it is staff's opinion that the agency lacks statutory authority to implement this Rule to the extent that the Rule requires a permit for projects that are outside an AEC. Pursuant to G.S. 113A-118(a), CAMA permits are required only "before undertaking any development **in any area of environmental concern**." The language of the Rule is ambiguous as to whether CRC is requiring a permit for a project that straddles the border of an AEC, which would fall under 113A-118(a), or*

whether CRC is requiring a permit for a project merely adjacent to an AEC which the agency believes might “adversely impact [an] AEC[].”

Moreover, among the enumerated requirements for a permit application for development outside an AEC, the agency includes the following:

*(3) maps or statements concerning the location of wetlands within the project area to the extent that a wetlands examination has been made by a private consultant or government agency. **Each developer of a project is urged, for his own protection and planning, to procure such information prior to submission for a CAMA permit;***

It is staff’s opinion that the bolded statement is subject to objection under all four bases identified by G.S. 150B-21.9. First, while CRC is permitted by G.S. 113A-119(a) to set the “form and content” of the application, the agency provides no statutory authority for requiring an applicant to procure and submit the results of a wetlands examination. Moreover, to the extent that the agency “urges” an applicant to undertake an action, the Rule does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirement upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, because this Rule does not meet the definition of a “Rule” pursuant to G.S.150B-2(8a), and the agency lacks the statutory authority to adopt it. Furthermore, the adoption of this Rule is not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S. 150B, as only “Rules” can be adopted. Finally, because the Rule does not meet the statutory definition of a “Rule” can be reasonably necessary pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3).

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07J .0203.

§ 113A-118. Permit required.

(a) After the date designated by the Secretary pursuant to G.S. 113A-125, every person before undertaking any development in any area of environmental concern shall obtain (in addition to any other required State or local permit) a permit pursuant to the provisions of this Part.

(b) Under the expedited procedure provided for by G.S. 113A-121, the permit shall be obtained from the appropriate city or county for any minor development; provided, that if the city or county has not developed an approved implementation and enforcement program, the permit shall be obtained from the Secretary.

(c) Permits shall be obtained from the Commission or its duly authorized agent.

(d) Within the meaning of this Part:

(1) A "major development" is any development which requires permission, licensing, approval, certification or authorization in any form from the Environmental Management Commission, the Department of Environmental Quality, the Department of Administration, the North Carolina Oil and Gas Commission, the North Carolina Pesticides Board, the North Carolina Sedimentation Control Board, or any federal agency or authority; or which occupies a land or water area in excess of 20 acres; or which contemplates drilling for or excavating natural resources on land or under water; or which occupies on a single parcel a structure or structures in excess of a ground area of 60,000 square feet.

(2) A "minor development" is any development other than a "major development."

(e) If, within the meaning of G.S. 113A-103(5)b3, the siting of any utility facility for the development, generation or transmission of energy is subject to regulation under this Article rather than by the State Utilities Commission or by other law, permits for such facilities shall be obtained from the Coastal Resources Commission rather than from the appropriate city or county.

(f) The Secretary may issue special emergency permits under this Article. These permits may only be issued in those extraordinary situations in which life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of storms, sudden failure of man-made structures, or similar occurrence. These permits may carry any conditions necessary to protect the public interest, consistent with the emergency situation and the impact of the proposed development. If an application for an emergency permit includes work beyond that necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property, the emergency permit shall be limited to that development reasonably necessary to reduce the imminent danger; all further development shall be considered under ordinary permit procedures. This emergency permit authority of the Secretary shall extend to all development in areas of environmental concern, whether major or minor development, and the mandatory notice provisions of G.S. 113A-119(b) shall not apply to these emergency permits. To the extent feasible, these emergency permits shall be coordinated with any emergency permits required under G.S. 113-229(e1). The fees

associated with any permit issued pursuant to this subsection or rules adopted pursuant to this subsection shall be waived. (1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1282, ss. 23, 33; c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 173; c. 518, s. 3; 1987, c. 827, s. 136; 1989, c. 727, s. 131; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2007-485, s. 5; 2012-143, s. 1(d); 2014-4, s. 4(c); 2015-241, s. 14.30(u).)

§ 113A-119. Permit applications generally.

(a) Any person required to obtain a permit under this Part shall file with the Secretary and (in the case of a permit sought from a city or county) with the designated local official an application for a permit in accordance with the form and content designated by the Secretary and approved by the Commission. The applicant must submit with the application an electronic payment, check, or money order payable to the Department or the city or county, as the case may be, constituting a fee set by the Commission pursuant to G.S. 113A-119.1.

(b) Upon receipt of any application, a significant modification to an application for a major permit, or an application to modify substantially a previously issued major permit, the Secretary shall issue public notice of the proposed development (i) with the exception of minor permit applications, by posting or causing to be posted a notice at the location of the proposed development stating that an application, a modification of an application for a major permit, or an application to modify a previously issued major permit for development has been made, where the application or modification may be inspected, and the time period for comments; and (ii) with the exception of minor permit applications, by publishing notice of the application or modification at least once in one newspaper of general circulation in the county or counties wherein the development would be located at least 20 days before final action on a major permit or before the beginning of the hearing on a permit under G.S. 113A-122. The notice shall set out that any comments on the development should be submitted to the Secretary by a specified date, not less than 15 days from the date of the newspaper publication of the notice or 15 days after mailing of the mailed notice, whichever is later.

(c) Within the meaning of this Part, the "designated local official" is the official who has been designated by the local governing body to receive and consider permit applications under this Part. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 307; 1985, c. 372; 1989, c. 53; c. 727, s. 132; 1989 (Reg. Sess., 1990), c. 987, s. 1; 2013-413, s. 30; 2017-209, s. 5(b); 2020-74, s. 2; 2021-158, s. 2(a).)

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.

- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
 - a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.

- b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
- c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
- d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
- e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
- f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
- g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
- h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.
- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-19.1. Requirements for agencies in the rule-making process.

(a) In developing and drafting rules for adoption in accordance with this Article, agencies shall adhere to the following principles:

- (1) An agency may adopt only rules that are expressly authorized by federal or State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest.

- (2) An agency shall seek to reduce the burden upon those persons or entities who must comply with the rule.
- (3) Rules shall be written in a clear and unambiguous manner and must be reasonably necessary to implement or interpret federal or State law.
- (4) An agency shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed. The agency shall not adopt a rule that is unnecessary or redundant.
- (5) When appropriate, rules shall be based on sound, reasonably available scientific, technical, economic, and other relevant information. Agencies shall include a reference to this information in the notice of text required by G.S. 150B-21.2(c).
- (6) Rules shall be designed to achieve the regulatory objective in a cost-effective and timely manner.

(b) Each agency subject to this Article shall conduct an annual review of its rules to identify existing rules that are unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent with the principles set forth in subsection (a) of this section. The agency shall repeal any rule identified by this review.

(c) Each agency subject to this Article shall post on its Web site, no later than the publication date of the notice of text in the North Carolina Register, all of the following:

- (1) The text of a proposed rule.
- (2) An explanation of the proposed rule and the reason for the proposed rule.
- (3) The federal certification required by subsection (g) of this section.
- (4) Instructions on how and where to submit oral or written comments on the proposed rule, including a description of the procedure by which a person can object to a proposed rule and subject the proposed rule to legislative review.
- (5) Any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule.

If an agency proposes any change to a rule or fiscal note prior to the date it proposes to adopt a rule, the agency shall publish the proposed change on its Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted. If an agency's staff proposes any such change to be presented to the rule-making agency, the staff shall publish the proposed change on the agency's Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted.

(d) Each agency shall determine whether its policies and programs overlap with the policies and programs of another agency. In the event two or more agencies' policies and programs overlap, the agencies shall coordinate the rules adopted by each agency to avoid unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent rules.

(e) Each agency shall quantify the costs and benefits to all parties of a proposed rule to the greatest extent possible. Prior to submission of a proposed rule for publication in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.2, the agency shall review the details of any fiscal note

prepared in connection with the proposed rule and approve the fiscal note before submission.

(f) If the agency determines that a proposed rule will have a substantial economic impact as defined in G.S. 150B-21.4(b1), the agency shall consider at least two alternatives to the proposed rule. The alternatives may have been identified by the agency or by members of the public.

(g) Whenever an agency proposes a rule that is purported to implement a federal law, or required by or necessary for compliance with federal law, or on which the receipt of federal funds is conditioned, the agency shall:

- (1) Prepare a certification identifying the federal law requiring adoption of the proposed rule. The certification shall contain a statement setting forth the reasons why the proposed rule is required by federal law. If all or part of the proposed rule is not required by federal law or exceeds the requirements of federal law, then the certification shall state the reasons for that opinion.
- (2) Post the certification on the agency Web site in accordance with subsection (c) of this section.
- (3) Maintain a copy of the federal law and provide to the Office of State Budget and Management the citation to the federal law requiring or pertaining to the proposed rule.

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 2014-120, s. 6(a), effective September 18, 2014, and applicable to proposed rules published on or after that date. (2011-398, s. 2; 2012-187, s. 3; 2013-143, s. 1.1; 2014-120, s. 6(a).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0206

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule, which covers the public notice that CRC is required to issue upon receipt of "any application, a significant modification to an application for a major permit, or an application to modify substantially a previously issued major permit," principally repeats the statutory language. To the extent that the Rule augments the statutory language, it adds ambiguous terms such as "reasonable time." Accordingly, staff recommends objection to this Rule as unnecessary and as unclear and ambiguous.

Moreover, the Rule goes on to require that any citizen or group who requests a copy of the application shall "promptly" be sent a copy upon payment of a "reasonable fee." For its statutory authority the agency relies solely on G.S. 113A-119(b), which contains no authorization to charge fees to the general public. Thus, staff further recommends objection to this Rule for lack of statutory authority.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 113A-119. Permit applications generally.

(a) Any person required to obtain a permit under this Part shall file with the Secretary and (in the case of a permit sought from a city or county) with the designated local official an application for a permit in accordance with the form and content designated by the Secretary and approved by the Commission. The applicant must submit with the application an electronic payment, check, or money order payable to the Department or the city or county, as the case may be, constituting a fee set by the Commission pursuant to G.S. 113A-119.1.

(b) Upon receipt of any application, a significant modification to an application for a major permit, or an application to modify substantially a previously issued major permit, the Secretary shall issue public notice of the proposed development (i) with the exception of minor permit applications, by posting or causing to be posted a notice at the location of the proposed development stating that an application, a modification of an application for a major permit, or an application to modify a previously issued major permit for development has been made, where the application or modification may be inspected, and the time period for comments; and (ii) with the exception of minor permit applications, by publishing notice of the application or modification at least once in one newspaper of general circulation in the county or counties wherein the development would be located at least 20 days before final action on a major permit or before the beginning of the hearing on a permit under G.S. 113A-122. The notice shall set out that any comments on the development should be submitted to the Secretary by a specified date, not less than 15 days from the date of the newspaper publication of the notice or 15 days after mailing of the mailed notice, whichever is later.

(c) Within the meaning of this Part, the "designated local official" is the official who has been designated by the local governing body to receive and consider permit applications under this Part. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 307; 1985, c. 372; 1989, c. 53; c. 727, s. 132; 1989 (Reg. Sess., 1990), c. 987, s. 1; 2013-413, s. 30; 2017-209, s. 5(b); 2020-74, s. 2; 2021-158, s. 2(a).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0207

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule concerns the solicitation and submission of agency comment on CAMA major permit applications as well as dredge and fill permits issued under G.S. 113-229.

The Rule states that the Department of Environmental Quality "will circulate major development permit applications to the several state review agencies having expertise in the criteria enumerated in G.S. 113A-120." However, neither G.S. 113A-120 nor the statutes cited by the agency for statutory authority directs CRC to provide applications to any other state agency for review. While G.S. 113-229 states that CRC "shall" circulate fill and dredge permit applications "among all State agencies and, in the discretion of the Secretary, appropriate federal agencies having jurisdiction over the subject matter which might be affected by the project so that such agencies will have an opportunity to raise any objections they might have" this statutory provision does not appear to reach CAMA permits issued under G.S. 113A-118. As such, it is staff's opinion that the agency lacks statutory authority for this provision.

Moreover, to the extent the agency possesses statutory authority, the Rule contains many instances of unclear or ambiguous language which obscure what the agency is requiring of the regulated public. For instance, the Rule states that a reviewing agency may request additional information from the applicant "if such information is deemed necessary for a thorough and complete review of the application." Thus, it is staff's opinion that the rule is impermissibly unclear and ambiguous.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 113-229. Permits to dredge or fill in or about estuarine waters or State-owned lakes.

(a) Except as hereinafter provided before any excavation or filling project is begun in any estuarine waters, tidelands, marshlands, or State-owned lakes, the party or parties desiring to do such shall first obtain a permit from the Department. Granting of the State permit shall not relieve any party from the necessity of obtaining a permit from the United States Army Corps of Engineers for work in navigable waters, if the same is required. The Department shall continue to coordinate projects pertaining to navigation with the United States Army Corps of Engineers.

(b) All applications for such permits shall include a plat of the areas in which the proposed work will take place, indicating the location, width, depth and length of any proposed channel, the disposal area, and a copy of the deed or other instrument under which the applicant claims title to the property adjoining the waters in question, (or any land covered by waters), tidelands, or marshlands, or if the applicant is not the owner, then a copy of the deed or other instrument under which the owner claims title plus written permission from the owner to carry out the project on his land.

(c) In lieu of a deed or other instrument referred to in subsection (b) of this section, the agency authorized to issue such permits may accept some other reasonable evidence of ownership of the property in question or other lawful authority to make use of the property.

(c1) The Coastal Resources Commission may, by rule, designate certain classes of major and minor development for which a general or blanket permit may be issued. In developing these rules, the Commission shall consider all of the following:

- (1) The size of the development.
- (2) The impact of the development on areas of environmental concern.
- (3) How often the class of development is carried out.
- (4) The need for on-site oversight of the development.
- (5) The need for public review and comment on individual development projects.

(c2) General permits may be issued by the Commission as rules under the provisions of G.S. 113A-118.1. Individual development carried out under the provisions of general permits shall not be subject to the mandatory notice provisions of this section. The Commission may impose reasonable notice provisions and other appropriate conditions and safeguards on any general permit it issues. The variance, appeals, and enforcement provisions of this Article shall apply to any individual development projects undertaken under a general permit.

(d) An applicant for a permit, other than an emergency permit, shall notify the owner of each tract of riparian property that adjoins that of the applicant. An applicant may satisfy the required notification of adjoining riparian property owners by either (i) obtaining from each adjoining riparian property owner a signed statement that the adjoining riparian property owner has no objection to the proposed project or (ii)

providing a copy of the applicant's permit application to each adjoining riparian property owner by certified mail. If the owner's address is unknown and cannot be ascertained with due diligence or if a diligent but unsuccessful effort has been made to serve the copy by certified mail, publication in accordance with the rules of the Commission shall serve to satisfy the notification requirement. An owner may file written objections to the permit with the Department for 30 days after the owner is served with a copy of the application by certified mail. In the case of a special emergency dredge or fill permit the applicant must certify that the applicant took all reasonable steps to notify adjacent riparian owners of the application for a special emergency dredge and fill permit prior to submission of the application. Upon receipt of this certification, the Secretary shall issue or deny the permit within the time period specified in subsection (e) of this section, upon the express understanding from the applicant that the applicant will be entirely liable and hold the State harmless for all damage to adjacent riparian landowners directly and proximately caused by the dredging or filling for which approval may be given.

(e) Applications for permits except special emergency permit applications shall be circulated by the Department among all State agencies and, in the discretion of the Secretary, appropriate federal agencies having jurisdiction over the subject matter which might be affected by the project so that such agencies will have an opportunity to raise any objections they might have. The Department may deny an application for a dredge or fill permit upon finding: (1) that there will be significant adverse effect of the proposed dredging and filling on the use of the water by the public; or (2) that there will be significant adverse effect on the value and enjoyment of the property of any riparian owners; or (3) that there will be significant adverse effect on public health, safety, and welfare; or (4) that there will be significant adverse effect on the conservation of public and private water supplies; or (5) that there will be significant adverse effect on wildlife or fresh water, estuarine or marine fisheries. In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. Such permit may be conditioned upon the applicant amending his proposal to take whatever measures are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in this subsection. Permits may allow for projects granted a permit the right to maintain such project for a period of up to 10 years. The right to maintain such project shall be granted subject to such conditions as may be reasonably necessary to protect the public interest. The Coastal Resources Commission shall coordinate the issuance of permits under this section and G.S. 113A-118 and the granting of variances under this section and G.S. 113A-120.1 to avoid duplication and to create a single, expedited permitting process. The Coastal Resources Commission may adopt rules interpreting and applying the provisions of this section and rules specifying the procedures for obtaining a permit under this section. Maintenance work as defined in this subsection shall be limited to such activities as are required to maintain the project dimensions as found in the permit granted. The Department shall act on an application for permit within 75 days after the completed application is filed, provided the Department may extend such deadline by not more than an additional 75 days if necessary properly to

consider the application, except for applications for a special emergency permit, in which case the Department shall act within two working days after an application is filed, and failure to so act shall automatically approve the application.

(e1) The Secretary is empowered to issue special emergency dredge or fill permits upon application. Emergency permits may be issued only when life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of rapid recent erosion or sudden failure of a man-made structure. The Coastal Resources Commission may elaborate by rule upon what conditions the Secretary may issue a special emergency dredge or fill permit. The Secretary may condition the emergency permit upon any reasonable conditions, consistent with the emergency situation, he feels are necessary to reasonably protect the public interest. Where an application for a special emergency permit includes work beyond which the Secretary, in his discretion, feels necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property he shall issue the emergency permit only for that part of the proposed work necessary to reasonably reduce the imminent danger. All further work must be applied for by application for an ordinary dredge or fill permit. The Secretary shall deny an application for a special dredge or fill permit upon a finding that the detriment to the public which would occur on issuance of the permit measured by the five factors in G.S. 113-229(e) clearly outweighs the detriment to the applicant if such permit application should be denied.

(f) A permit applicant who is dissatisfied with a decision on his application may file a petition for a contested case hearing under G.S. 150B-23 within 20 days after the decision is made. Any other person who is dissatisfied with a decision to deny or grant a permit may file a petition for a contested case hearing only if the Coastal Resources Commission determines, in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(c), that a hearing is appropriate. A permit is suspended from the time a person seeks administrative review of the decision concerning the permit until the Commission determines that the person seeking the review cannot commence a contested case or the issuance of a final decision in a contested case, as appropriate, and no action may be taken during that time that would be unlawful in the absence of the permit.

(g) G.S. 113A-122 applies to an appeal of a permit decision under subsection (f).

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 105.

(h1) Except as provided in subsection (h2) of this section, all construction and maintenance dredgings of beach-quality sand may be placed on the affected downdrift ocean beaches or, if placed elsewhere, an equivalent quality and quantity of sand from another location shall be placed on the downdrift ocean beaches.

(h2) Clean, beach quality material dredged from navigational channels within the active nearshore, beach or inlet shoal systems shall not be removed permanently from the active nearshore, beach or inlet shoal system. This dredged material shall be disposed of on the ocean beach or shallow active nearshore area where it is environmentally acceptable and compatible with other uses of the beach.

(i) Subject to subsections (h1) and (h2) of this section, all materials excavated pursuant to such permit, regardless of where placed, shall be encased or entrapped in such a manner as to minimize their moving back into the affected water.

(j) None of the provisions of this section shall relieve any riparian owner of the requirements imposed by the applicable laws and regulations of the United States.

(k) Any person, firm, or corporation violating the provisions of this section shall be guilty of a Class 2 misdemeanor. Each day's continued operation after notice by the Department to cease shall constitute a separate offense. A notice to cease shall be served personally or by certified mail.

(l) The Secretary may, either before or after the institution of proceedings under subsection (k) of this section, institute a civil action in the superior court in the name of the State upon the relation of the Secretary, for damages, and injunctive relief, and for such other and further relief in the premises as said court may deem proper, to prevent or recover for any damage to any lands or property which the State holds in the public trust, and to restrain any violation of this section or of any provision of a dredging or filling permit issued under this section. Neither the institution of the action nor any of the proceedings thereon shall relieve any party to such proceedings from the penalty prescribed by this section for any violation of the same.

(m) This section shall apply to all persons, firms, or corporations, their employees, agents, or contractors proposing excavation or filling work in the estuarine waters, tidelands, marshlands and State-owned lakes within the State, and the work to be performed by the State government or local governments. Provided, however, the provisions of this section shall not apply to the activities and functions of the Department and local health departments that are engaged in mosquito control for the protection of the health and welfare of the people of the coastal area of North Carolina as provided under G.S. 130A-346 through G.S. 130A-349. Provided, further, this section shall not impair the riparian right of ingress and egress to navigable waters.

(n) Within the meaning of this section:

(1) "State-owned lakes" include man-made as well as natural lakes.

(2) "Estuarine waters" means all the waters of the Atlantic Ocean within the boundary of North Carolina and all the waters of the bays, sounds, rivers, and tributaries thereto seaward of the dividing line between coastal fishing waters and inland fishing waters agreed upon by the Department and the Wildlife Resources Commission, within the meaning of G.S. 113-129.

(3) "Marshland" means any salt marsh or other marsh subject to regular or occasional flooding by tides, including wind tides (whether or not the tidewaters reach the marshland areas through natural or artificial watercourses), provided this shall not include hurricane or tropical storm tides. Salt marshland or other marsh shall be those areas upon which grow some, but not necessarily all, of the following salt marsh

and marsh plant species: Smooth or salt water Cordgrass (*Spartina alterniflora*), Black Needlerush (*Juncus roemerianus*), Glasswort (*Salicornia* spp.), Salt Grass (*Distichlis spicata*), Sea Lavender (*Limonium* spp.), Bulrush (*Scirpus* spp.), Saw Grass (*Cladium jamaicense*), Cattail (*Typha* spp.), Salt-Meadow Grass (*Spartina patens*), and Salt Reed-Grass (*Spartina cynosuroides*). (1969, c. 791, s. 1; 1971, c. 1159, s. 6; 1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1262, ss. 28, 86; c. 1331, s. 3; 1975, c. 456, ss. 1-7; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, ss. 1, 2; 1983, c. 258, ss. 1-3; c. 442, s. 2; 1987, c. 827, s. 105; 1989, c. 727, s. 107; 1993, c. 539, s. 844; 1994, Ex. Sess., c. 24, s. 14(c); 1993 (Reg. Sess., 1994), c. 777, s. 6(a), (b); 1995, c. 509, s. 55.1(a)-(c); 2000-172, ss. 3.1, 3.2; 2002-126, ss. 29.2(h)-(j); 2011-398, s. 36; 2013-413, s. 55.)

§ 113A-118. Permit required.

(a) After the date designated by the Secretary pursuant to G.S. 113A-125, every person before undertaking any development in any area of environmental concern shall obtain (in addition to any other required State or local permit) a permit pursuant to the provisions of this Part.

(b) Under the expedited procedure provided for by G.S. 113A-121, the permit shall be obtained from the appropriate city or county for any minor development; provided, that if the city or county has not developed an approved implementation and enforcement program, the permit shall be obtained from the Secretary.

(c) Permits shall be obtained from the Commission or its duly authorized agent.

(d) Within the meaning of this Part:

(1) A "major development" is any development which requires permission, licensing, approval, certification or authorization in any form from the Environmental Management Commission, the Department of Environmental Quality, the Department of Administration, the North Carolina Oil and Gas Commission, the North Carolina Pesticides Board, the North Carolina Sedimentation Control Board, or any federal agency or authority; or which occupies a land or water area in excess of 20 acres; or which contemplates drilling for or excavating natural resources on land or under water; or which occupies on a single parcel a structure or structures in excess of a ground area of 60,000 square feet.

(2) A "minor development" is any development other than a "major development."

(e) If, within the meaning of G.S. 113A-103(5)b3, the siting of any utility facility for the development, generation or transmission of energy is subject to regulation under this Article rather than by the State Utilities Commission or by other law, permits for such

facilities shall be obtained from the Coastal Resources Commission rather than from the appropriate city or county.

(f) The Secretary may issue special emergency permits under this Article. These permits may only be issued in those extraordinary situations in which life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of storms, sudden failure of man-made structures, or similar occurrence. These permits may carry any conditions necessary to protect the public interest, consistent with the emergency situation and the impact of the proposed development. If an application for an emergency permit includes work beyond that necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property, the emergency permit shall be limited to that development reasonably necessary to reduce the imminent danger; all further development shall be considered under ordinary permit procedures. This emergency permit authority of the Secretary shall extend to all development in areas of environmental concern, whether major or minor development, and the mandatory notice provisions of G.S. 113A-119(b) shall not apply to these emergency permits. To the extent feasible, these emergency permits shall be coordinated with any emergency permits required under G.S. 113-229(e1). The fees associated with any permit issued pursuant to this subsection or rules adopted pursuant to this subsection shall be waived. (1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1282, ss. 23, 33; c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 173; c. 518, s. 3; 1987, c. 827, s. 136; 1989, c. 727, s. 131; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2007-485, s. 5; 2012-143, s. 1(d); 2014-4, s. 4(c); 2015-241, s. 14.30(u).)

§ 113A-120. Grant or denial of permits.

- (a) The responsible official or body shall deny an application for a permit upon finding:
- (1) In the case of coastal wetlands, that the development would contravene an order that has been or could be issued pursuant to G.S. 113-230.
 - (2) In the case of estuarine waters, that a permit for the development would be denied pursuant to G.S. 113-229(e).
 - (3) In the case of a renewable resource area, that the development will result in loss or significant reduction of continued long-range productivity that would jeopardize one or more of the water, food or fiber requirements of more than local concern identified in subdivisions a through c of G.S. 113A-113(b)(3).
 - (4) In the case of a fragile or historic area, or other area containing environmental or natural resources of more than local significance, that the development will result in major or irreversible damage to one or more of the historic, cultural, scientific, environmental or scenic values or natural systems identified in subdivisions a through h of G.S. 113A-113(b)(4).
 - (5) In the case of areas covered by G.S. 113A-113(b)(5), that the development will jeopardize the public rights or interests specified in said subdivision.

- (6) In the case of natural hazard areas, that the development would occur in one or more of the areas identified in subdivisions a through e of G.S. 113A-113(b)(6) in such a manner as to unreasonably endanger life or property.
 - (7) In the case of areas which are or may be impacted by key facilities, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans, or would contravene any of the provisions of subdivisions (1) to (6) of this subsection.
 - (8) In any case, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans.
 - (9) In any case, that considering engineering requirements and all economic costs there is a practicable alternative that would accomplish the overall project purposes with less adverse impact on the public resources.
 - (10) In any case, that the proposed development would contribute to cumulative effects that would be inconsistent with the guidelines set forth in subdivisions (1) through (9) of this subsection. Cumulative effects are impacts attributable to the collective effects of a number of projects and include the effects of additional projects similar to the requested permit in areas available for development in the vicinity.
- (b) In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. The permit may be conditioned upon the applicant's amending his proposal to take whatever measures or agreeing to carry out whatever terms of operation or use of the development that are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in subsection (a) of this section.
- (b1) In addition to those factors set out in subsection (a) of this section, and notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (b) of this section, the responsible official or body may deny an application for a permit upon finding that an applicant, or any parent or subsidiary corporation if the applicant is a corporation:
- (1) Is conducting or has conducted any activity causing significant environmental damage for which a major development permit is required under this Article without having previously obtained such permit or has received a notice of violation with respect to any activity governed by this Article and has not complied with the notice within the time specified in the notice;
 - (2) Has failed to pay a civil penalty assessed pursuant to this Article, a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article, or Article 17 of Chapter 113 of the General Statutes which is due and for which no appeal is pending;
 - (3) Has been convicted of a misdemeanor pursuant to G.S. 113A-126, G.S. 113-229(k), or any criminal provision of a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article; or

- (4) Has failed to substantially comply with State rules or local ordinances and regulations adopted pursuant to this Article or with other federal and state laws, regulations, and rules for the protection of the environment.

(b2) For purposes of subsection (b1) of this section, an applicant's record may be considered for only the two years prior to the application date.

(c) Repealed by Session Laws 1989, c. 676, s. 7. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 518, ss. 4, 5; 1987, c. 827, s. 138; 1989, c. 51; c. 676, s. 7; 1997-337, s. 2; 1997-456, s. 55.2B; 1997-496, s. 2; 2000-172, s. 2.1.)

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0208

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - X Lack of statutory authority
 - Unclear or ambiguous
 - Unnecessary
 - Failure to comply with the APA
- Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule concerns the conditions that may be placed upon a permit issued under the Coastal Area Management Act ("CAMA") found in Article 7, Chapter 113A of the General Statutes.

The Rule states the "several state review agencies may submit specific recommendations regarding the manner in which the requested work should be carried out and suggest reasonable limitations on the work in order to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in G.S. 113A-120 and/or 113-229(c)." The Rule goes on to state that those agencies may "submit specific recommendations regarding limitations to be placed on the operation and/or maintenance of the completed project."

However, neither G.S. 113A-120 nor the statutes cited by the agency for statutory authority directs CRC to provide CAMA permit applications to any other state agency for review. While G.S. 113-229 states that CRC "shall" circulate fill and dredge permit applications "among all State agencies and, in the discretion of the Secretary, appropriate federal agencies having jurisdiction over the subject matter which might be affected by the project so that such agencies will have an opportunity to raise any objections they might have" this statutory provision does not appear to reach CAMA permits issued under Article 7, Chapter 113A of the General Statutes. As such, it is staff's opinion that the agency lacks statutory authority for this provision.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel

§ 113-229. Permits to dredge or fill in or about estuarine waters or State-owned lakes.

(a) Except as hereinafter provided before any excavation or filling project is begun in any estuarine waters, tidelands, marshlands, or State-owned lakes, the party or parties desiring to do such shall first obtain a permit from the Department. Granting of the State permit shall not relieve any party from the necessity of obtaining a permit from the United States Army Corps of Engineers for work in navigable waters, if the same is required. The Department shall continue to coordinate projects pertaining to navigation with the United States Army Corps of Engineers.

(b) All applications for such permits shall include a plat of the areas in which the proposed work will take place, indicating the location, width, depth and length of any proposed channel, the disposal area, and a copy of the deed or other instrument under which the applicant claims title to the property adjoining the waters in question, (or any land covered by waters), tidelands, or marshlands, or if the applicant is not the owner, then a copy of the deed or other instrument under which the owner claims title plus written permission from the owner to carry out the project on his land.

(c) In lieu of a deed or other instrument referred to in subsection (b) of this section, the agency authorized to issue such permits may accept some other reasonable evidence of ownership of the property in question or other lawful authority to make use of the property.

(c1) The Coastal Resources Commission may, by rule, designate certain classes of major and minor development for which a general or blanket permit may be issued. In developing these rules, the Commission shall consider all of the following:

- (1) The size of the development.
- (2) The impact of the development on areas of environmental concern.
- (3) How often the class of development is carried out.
- (4) The need for on-site oversight of the development.
- (5) The need for public review and comment on individual development projects.

(c2) General permits may be issued by the Commission as rules under the provisions of G.S. 113A-118.1. Individual development carried out under the provisions of general permits shall not be subject to the mandatory notice provisions of this section. The Commission may impose reasonable notice provisions and other appropriate conditions and safeguards on any general permit it issues. The variance, appeals, and enforcement provisions of this Article shall apply to any individual development projects undertaken under a general permit.

(d) An applicant for a permit, other than an emergency permit, shall notify the owner of each tract of riparian property that adjoins that of the applicant. An applicant may satisfy the required notification of adjoining riparian property owners by either (i) obtaining from each adjoining riparian property owner a signed statement that the adjoining riparian property owner has no objection to the proposed project or (ii)

providing a copy of the applicant's permit application to each adjoining riparian property owner by certified mail. If the owner's address is unknown and cannot be ascertained with due diligence or if a diligent but unsuccessful effort has been made to serve the copy by certified mail, publication in accordance with the rules of the Commission shall serve to satisfy the notification requirement. An owner may file written objections to the permit with the Department for 30 days after the owner is served with a copy of the application by certified mail. In the case of a special emergency dredge or fill permit the applicant must certify that the applicant took all reasonable steps to notify adjacent riparian owners of the application for a special emergency dredge and fill permit prior to submission of the application. Upon receipt of this certification, the Secretary shall issue or deny the permit within the time period specified in subsection (e) of this section, upon the express understanding from the applicant that the applicant will be entirely liable and hold the State harmless for all damage to adjacent riparian landowners directly and proximately caused by the dredging or filling for which approval may be given.

(e) Applications for permits except special emergency permit applications shall be circulated by the Department among all State agencies and, in the discretion of the Secretary, appropriate federal agencies having jurisdiction over the subject matter which might be affected by the project so that such agencies will have an opportunity to raise any objections they might have. The Department may deny an application for a dredge or fill permit upon finding: (1) that there will be significant adverse effect of the proposed dredging and filling on the use of the water by the public; or (2) that there will be significant adverse effect on the value and enjoyment of the property of any riparian owners; or (3) that there will be significant adverse effect on public health, safety, and welfare; or (4) that there will be significant adverse effect on the conservation of public and private water supplies; or (5) that there will be significant adverse effect on wildlife or fresh water, estuarine or marine fisheries. In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. Such permit may be conditioned upon the applicant amending his proposal to take whatever measures are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in this subsection. Permits may allow for projects granted a permit the right to maintain such project for a period of up to 10 years. The right to maintain such project shall be granted subject to such conditions as may be reasonably necessary to protect the public interest. The Coastal Resources Commission shall coordinate the issuance of permits under this section and G.S. 113A-118 and the granting of variances under this section and G.S. 113A-120.1 to avoid duplication and to create a single, expedited permitting process. The Coastal Resources Commission may adopt rules interpreting and applying the provisions of this section and rules specifying the procedures for obtaining a permit under this section. Maintenance work as defined in this subsection shall be limited to such activities as are required to maintain the project dimensions as found in the permit granted. The Department shall act on an application for permit within 75 days after the completed application is filed, provided the Department may extend such deadline by not more than an additional 75 days if necessary properly to

consider the application, except for applications for a special emergency permit, in which case the Department shall act within two working days after an application is filed, and failure to so act shall automatically approve the application.

(e1) The Secretary is empowered to issue special emergency dredge or fill permits upon application. Emergency permits may be issued only when life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of rapid recent erosion or sudden failure of a man-made structure. The Coastal Resources Commission may elaborate by rule upon what conditions the Secretary may issue a special emergency dredge or fill permit. The Secretary may condition the emergency permit upon any reasonable conditions, consistent with the emergency situation, he feels are necessary to reasonably protect the public interest. Where an application for a special emergency permit includes work beyond which the Secretary, in his discretion, feels necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property he shall issue the emergency permit only for that part of the proposed work necessary to reasonably reduce the imminent danger. All further work must be applied for by application for an ordinary dredge or fill permit. The Secretary shall deny an application for a special dredge or fill permit upon a finding that the detriment to the public which would occur on issuance of the permit measured by the five factors in G.S. 113-229(e) clearly outweighs the detriment to the applicant if such permit application should be denied.

(f) A permit applicant who is dissatisfied with a decision on his application may file a petition for a contested case hearing under G.S. 150B-23 within 20 days after the decision is made. Any other person who is dissatisfied with a decision to deny or grant a permit may file a petition for a contested case hearing only if the Coastal Resources Commission determines, in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(c), that a hearing is appropriate. A permit is suspended from the time a person seeks administrative review of the decision concerning the permit until the Commission determines that the person seeking the review cannot commence a contested case or the issuance of a final decision in a contested case, as appropriate, and no action may be taken during that time that would be unlawful in the absence of the permit.

(g) G.S. 113A-122 applies to an appeal of a permit decision under subsection (f).

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 105.

(h1) Except as provided in subsection (h2) of this section, all construction and maintenance dredgings of beach-quality sand may be placed on the affected downdrift ocean beaches or, if placed elsewhere, an equivalent quality and quantity of sand from another location shall be placed on the downdrift ocean beaches.

(h2) Clean, beach quality material dredged from navigational channels within the active nearshore, beach or inlet shoal systems shall not be removed permanently from the active nearshore, beach or inlet shoal system. This dredged material shall be disposed of on the ocean beach or shallow active nearshore area where it is environmentally acceptable and compatible with other uses of the beach.

(i) Subject to subsections (h1) and (h2) of this section, all materials excavated pursuant to such permit, regardless of where placed, shall be encased or entrapped in such a manner as to minimize their moving back into the affected water.

(j) None of the provisions of this section shall relieve any riparian owner of the requirements imposed by the applicable laws and regulations of the United States.

(k) Any person, firm, or corporation violating the provisions of this section shall be guilty of a Class 2 misdemeanor. Each day's continued operation after notice by the Department to cease shall constitute a separate offense. A notice to cease shall be served personally or by certified mail.

(l) The Secretary may, either before or after the institution of proceedings under subsection (k) of this section, institute a civil action in the superior court in the name of the State upon the relation of the Secretary, for damages, and injunctive relief, and for such other and further relief in the premises as said court may deem proper, to prevent or recover for any damage to any lands or property which the State holds in the public trust, and to restrain any violation of this section or of any provision of a dredging or filling permit issued under this section. Neither the institution of the action nor any of the proceedings thereon shall relieve any party to such proceedings from the penalty prescribed by this section for any violation of the same.

(m) This section shall apply to all persons, firms, or corporations, their employees, agents, or contractors proposing excavation or filling work in the estuarine waters, tidelands, marshlands and State-owned lakes within the State, and the work to be performed by the State government or local governments. Provided, however, the provisions of this section shall not apply to the activities and functions of the Department and local health departments that are engaged in mosquito control for the protection of the health and welfare of the people of the coastal area of North Carolina as provided under G.S. 130A-346 through G.S. 130A-349. Provided, further, this section shall not impair the riparian right of ingress and egress to navigable waters.

(n) Within the meaning of this section:

(1) "State-owned lakes" include man-made as well as natural lakes.

(2) "Estuarine waters" means all the waters of the Atlantic Ocean within the boundary of North Carolina and all the waters of the bays, sounds, rivers, and tributaries thereto seaward of the dividing line between coastal fishing waters and inland fishing waters agreed upon by the Department and the Wildlife Resources Commission, within the meaning of G.S. 113-129.

(3) "Marshland" means any salt marsh or other marsh subject to regular or occasional flooding by tides, including wind tides (whether or not the tidewaters reach the marshland areas through natural or artificial watercourses), provided this shall not include hurricane or tropical storm tides. Salt marshland or other marsh shall be those areas upon which grow some, but not necessarily all, of the following salt marsh

and marsh plant species: Smooth or salt water Cordgrass (*Spartina alterniflora*), Black Needlerush (*Juncus roemerianus*), Glasswort (*Salicornia* spp.), Salt Grass (*Distichlis spicata*), Sea Lavender (*Limonium* spp.), Bulrush (*Scirpus* spp.), Saw Grass (*Cladium jamaicense*), Cattail (*Typha* spp.), Salt-Meadow Grass (*Spartina patens*), and Salt Reed-Grass (*Spartina cynosuroides*). (1969, c. 791, s. 1; 1971, c. 1159, s. 6; 1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1262, ss. 28, 86; c. 1331, s. 3; 1975, c. 456, ss. 1-7; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, ss. 1, 2; 1983, c. 258, ss. 1-3; c. 442, s. 2; 1987, c. 827, s. 105; 1989, c. 727, s. 107; 1993, c. 539, s. 844; 1994, Ex. Sess., c. 24, s. 14(c); 1993 (Reg. Sess., 1994), c. 777, s. 6(a), (b); 1995, c. 509, s. 55.1(a)-(c); 2000-172, ss. 3.1, 3.2; 2002-126, ss. 29.2(h)-(j); 2011-398, s. 36; 2013-413, s. 55.)

§ 113A-118. Permit required.

(a) After the date designated by the Secretary pursuant to G.S. 113A-125, every person before undertaking any development in any area of environmental concern shall obtain (in addition to any other required State or local permit) a permit pursuant to the provisions of this Part.

(b) Under the expedited procedure provided for by G.S. 113A-121, the permit shall be obtained from the appropriate city or county for any minor development; provided, that if the city or county has not developed an approved implementation and enforcement program, the permit shall be obtained from the Secretary.

(c) Permits shall be obtained from the Commission or its duly authorized agent.

(d) Within the meaning of this Part:

(1) A "major development" is any development which requires permission, licensing, approval, certification or authorization in any form from the Environmental Management Commission, the Department of Environmental Quality, the Department of Administration, the North Carolina Oil and Gas Commission, the North Carolina Pesticides Board, the North Carolina Sedimentation Control Board, or any federal agency or authority; or which occupies a land or water area in excess of 20 acres; or which contemplates drilling for or excavating natural resources on land or under water; or which occupies on a single parcel a structure or structures in excess of a ground area of 60,000 square feet.

(2) A "minor development" is any development other than a "major development."

(e) If, within the meaning of G.S. 113A-103(5)b3, the siting of any utility facility for the development, generation or transmission of energy is subject to regulation under this Article rather than by the State Utilities Commission or by other law, permits for such

facilities shall be obtained from the Coastal Resources Commission rather than from the appropriate city or county.

(f) The Secretary may issue special emergency permits under this Article. These permits may only be issued in those extraordinary situations in which life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of storms, sudden failure of man-made structures, or similar occurrence. These permits may carry any conditions necessary to protect the public interest, consistent with the emergency situation and the impact of the proposed development. If an application for an emergency permit includes work beyond that necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property, the emergency permit shall be limited to that development reasonably necessary to reduce the imminent danger; all further development shall be considered under ordinary permit procedures. This emergency permit authority of the Secretary shall extend to all development in areas of environmental concern, whether major or minor development, and the mandatory notice provisions of G.S. 113A-119(b) shall not apply to these emergency permits. To the extent feasible, these emergency permits shall be coordinated with any emergency permits required under G.S. 113-229(e1). The fees associated with any permit issued pursuant to this subsection or rules adopted pursuant to this subsection shall be waived. (1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1282, ss. 23, 33; c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 173; c. 518, s. 3; 1987, c. 827, s. 136; 1989, c. 727, s. 131; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2007-485, s. 5; 2012-143, s. 1(d); 2014-4, s. 4(c); 2015-241, s. 14.30(u).)

§ 113A-120. Grant or denial of permits.

- (a) The responsible official or body shall deny an application for a permit upon finding:
- (1) In the case of coastal wetlands, that the development would contravene an order that has been or could be issued pursuant to G.S. 113-230.
 - (2) In the case of estuarine waters, that a permit for the development would be denied pursuant to G.S. 113-229(e).
 - (3) In the case of a renewable resource area, that the development will result in loss or significant reduction of continued long-range productivity that would jeopardize one or more of the water, food or fiber requirements of more than local concern identified in subdivisions a through c of G.S. 113A-113(b)(3).
 - (4) In the case of a fragile or historic area, or other area containing environmental or natural resources of more than local significance, that the development will result in major or irreversible damage to one or more of the historic, cultural, scientific, environmental or scenic values or natural systems identified in subdivisions a through h of G.S. 113A-113(b)(4).
 - (5) In the case of areas covered by G.S. 113A-113(b)(5), that the development will jeopardize the public rights or interests specified in said subdivision.

- (6) In the case of natural hazard areas, that the development would occur in one or more of the areas identified in subdivisions a through e of G.S. 113A-113(b)(6) in such a manner as to unreasonably endanger life or property.
- (7) In the case of areas which are or may be impacted by key facilities, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans, or would contravene any of the provisions of subdivisions (1) to (6) of this subsection.
- (8) In any case, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans.
- (9) In any case, that considering engineering requirements and all economic costs there is a practicable alternative that would accomplish the overall project purposes with less adverse impact on the public resources.
- (10) In any case, that the proposed development would contribute to cumulative effects that would be inconsistent with the guidelines set forth in subdivisions (1) through (9) of this subsection. Cumulative effects are impacts attributable to the collective effects of a number of projects and include the effects of additional projects similar to the requested permit in areas available for development in the vicinity.

(b) In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. The permit may be conditioned upon the applicant's amending his proposal to take whatever measures or agreeing to carry out whatever terms of operation or use of the development that are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in subsection (a) of this section.

(b1) In addition to those factors set out in subsection (a) of this section, and notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (b) of this section, the responsible official or body may deny an application for a permit upon finding that an applicant, or any parent or subsidiary corporation if the applicant is a corporation:

- (1) Is conducting or has conducted any activity causing significant environmental damage for which a major development permit is required under this Article without having previously obtained such permit or has received a notice of violation with respect to any activity governed by this Article and has not complied with the notice within the time specified in the notice;
- (2) Has failed to pay a civil penalty assessed pursuant to this Article, a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article, or Article 17 of Chapter 113 of the General Statutes which is due and for which no appeal is pending;
- (3) Has been convicted of a misdemeanor pursuant to G.S. 113A-126, G.S. 113-229(k), or any criminal provision of a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article; or

- (4) Has failed to substantially comply with State rules or local ordinances and regulations adopted pursuant to this Article or with other federal and state laws, regulations, and rules for the protection of the environment.

(b2) For purposes of subsection (b1) of this section, an applicant's record may be considered for only the two years prior to the application date.

(c) Repealed by Session Laws 1989, c. 676, s. 7. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 518, ss. 4, 5; 1987, c. 827, s. 138; 1989, c. 51; c. 676, s. 7; 1997-337, s. 2; 1997-456, s. 55.2B; 1997-496, s. 2; 2000-172, s. 2.1.)

§ 113A-124. Additional powers and duties.

(c) The Commission shall have the following additional powers and duties under this Article:

- (1) To recommend to the Secretary the acceptance of donations, gifts, grants, contributions and appropriations from any public or private source to use in carrying out the provisions of this Article.
- (2) To recommend to the Secretary of Administration the acquisition by purchase, gift, condemnation, or otherwise, lands or any interest in any lands within the coastal area.
- (3) To hold such public hearings as the Commission deems appropriate.
- (4) To delegate the power to conduct a hearing, on behalf of the Commission, to any member of the Commission or to any qualified employee of the Department. Any person to whom a delegation of power is made to conduct a hearing shall report his recommendations with the evidence and the record of the hearing to the Commission for decision or action.
- (5) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 141.
- (6) To delegate the power to determine whether a contested case hearing is appropriate in accordance with G.S. 113A-121.1(b).
- (7) To delegate the power to grant or deny requests for declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4 in accordance with standards adopted by the Commission.
- (8) To adopt rules to implement this Article.
- (9) To delegate the power to approve land-use plans in accordance with G.S. 113A-110(f) to any qualified employee of the Department.

(d) The Attorney General shall act as attorney for the Commission and shall initiate actions in the name of, and at the request of, the Commission, and shall represent the Commission in the hearing of any appeal from or other review of any order of the Commission. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, ss. 125, 141; 1989, c. 727, s. 135; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 2; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2015-241, s. 14.30(v); 2017-209, s. 5(a); 2021-158, s. 2(b).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0403

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority (in part)
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary (in part)
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA (in part)
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

The Rule is riddled with such ambiguous terms as “sufficient”, “significant”, “relevant”, “reasonable”, “necessary”, and “practicable” that it is difficult to discern whether the agency intends the Rule to be a broad policy statement of goals or substantive requirements upon the regulated public.

Further, the agency uses phrases such as “local resources”, “earliest feasible stage”, “shoreline areas”, “energy facilities”, “petroleum facilities”, “Oil Spill Resource Plan”, and “areas of high biological or recreational value” without definition or reference to any statute or code, or supplying criteria upon which to evaluate the same, such that the regulated public, and perhaps the agency employees, cannot determine objectively what the law is.

*G.S. 150B-19.1(a)(1) states, “An agency may adopt only **rules (emphasis added)** that are expressively authorized by federal and State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest.”*

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0403 contains broad policy statements, it does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, it does not meet the definition of a “Rule” pursuant to G.S.150B-2(8a).

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0403 does not meet the definition of a “Rule”, the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt it. Further, the adoption of 15A NCAC 07M .0403 was not in accordance

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

with Article 2A of G.S.150B as only "Rules" can be adopted. Lastly, to the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0403 is not a "Rule" it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

To the extent that the Rule imposes any substantive requirements, 15A NCAC 07M .0403, as written, is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

Accordingly, staff counsel recommends that the Rules Review Commission object to 15A NCAC 07M .0403.

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
- a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance

with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0503

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority (in part)
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary (in part)
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA (in part)
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

The Rule is riddled with such ambiguous phrases as "the Commission will establish", "the Commission hereby establishes guidelines", "the Commission will advise", and "should be" that it is difficult to discern whether the agency intends the Rule to be a broad policy statement or substantive requirements upon the regulated public.

Further, the agency uses phrases such as "applicable policies and standards", "guidelines", "sound coastal engineering standards", "hazardous areas", "a safe and sound manner", "areas desirable for public access or use", and "adequate" without definition or reference to any statute or code, or supplying criteria upon which to evaluate the same, such that the regulated public, and perhaps the agency employees, cannot determine objectively what the law is.

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0503 contains broad policy statements, it does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, it does not meet the definition of a "Rule" pursuant to G.S. 150B-2(8a).

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0503 is not a "Rule", the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt it. Further, the adoption of 15A NCAC 07M .0503 was not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S. 150-B as only "Rules" can be adopted. Lastly, to the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .0503 is not a "Rule" it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

To the extent that the Rule imposes substantive requirements, 15A NCAC 07M .0503, as written, is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

Accordingly, staff counsel recommends that the Rules Review Commission object to 15A NCAC 07M .0503.

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
 - a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance

with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .1201

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☒ Unnecessary
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

*G.S. 150B-19.1(a)(1) states, "An agency may adopt only **rules (emphasis added)** that are expressly authorized by federal and State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest."*

15A NCAC 07M .1201 is a "Declaration of General Policy" which does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, it does not meet the definition of a "Rule" pursuant to G.S.150B-2(8a).

As 15A NCAC 07M .1201 is not a "Rule", the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt it. Further, the adoption of 15A NCAC 07M .1201 was not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S.150B as only "Rules" can be adopted. Lastly, as 15A NCAC 07M .1201 is not a "Rule" it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

There are two arguably substantive sentences in the Rule:

"NO OCEAN MINING SHALL BE CONDUCTED UNLESS PLANS FOR SUCH MINING INCLUDE REASONABLE PROVISIONS FOR PROTECTION OF THE PHYSICAL ENVIRONMENT, ITS RESOURCES, AND APPROPRIATE RECLAMATION OR MITIGATION OF THE AFFECTED AREAAS SET FORTH AND

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

IMPLEMENTED UNDER AUTHORITY OF THE MINING ACT (G.S. 74-48) AND
COASTAL AREA MANAGEMENT ACT (G.S. 113A-100).”

AND

“THE SITING AND TIMING OF SUCH ACTIVITIES SHALL BE CONSISTENT WITH
ESTABLISHED STATE STANDARDS AND REGULATIONS AND SHALL COMPLY
WITH APPLICABLE LOCAL LAND USE PLAN POLICIES, AND AEC USE
STANDARDS.”

Both sentences appear to require adherence to statutes or rules which are already applicable to the regulated public. In short, it is the same as passing a law which states that existing law must be obeyed. The sentences are therefore duplicative, and unnecessary pursuant G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3).

Assuming arguendo that that 15A NCAC 07M .1201 meets the definition of a “Rule”, and the above quoted sentences are necessary, 15A NCAC 07M .1201, as written, is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

Accordingly, staff counsel recommends that the Rules Review Commission object to 15A NCAC 07M .1201.

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
 - a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-19.1. Requirements for agencies in the rule-making process.

(a) In developing and drafting rules for adoption in accordance with this Article, agencies shall adhere to the following principles:

- (1) An agency may adopt only rules that are expressly authorized by federal or State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest.
- (2) An agency shall seek to reduce the burden upon those persons or entities who must comply with the rule.
- (3) Rules shall be written in a clear and unambiguous manner and must be reasonably necessary to implement or interpret federal or State law.
- (4) An agency shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed. The agency shall not adopt a rule that is unnecessary or redundant.
- (5) When appropriate, rules shall be based on sound, reasonably available scientific, technical, economic, and other relevant information. Agencies shall include a reference to this information in the notice of text required by G.S. 150B-21.2(c).
- (6) Rules shall be designed to achieve the regulatory objective in a cost-effective and timely manner.

(b) Each agency subject to this Article shall conduct an annual review of its rules to identify existing rules that are unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent with the principles set forth in subsection (a) of this section. The agency shall repeal any rule identified by this review.

(c) Each agency subject to this Article shall post on its Web site, no later than the publication date of the notice of text in the North Carolina Register, all of the following:

- (1) The text of a proposed rule.
- (2) An explanation of the proposed rule and the reason for the proposed rule.
- (3) The federal certification required by subsection (g) of this section.

- (4) Instructions on how and where to submit oral or written comments on the proposed rule, including a description of the procedure by which a person can object to a proposed rule and subject the proposed rule to legislative review.

- (5) Any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule.

If an agency proposes any change to a rule or fiscal note prior to the date it proposes to adopt a rule, the agency shall publish the proposed change on its Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted. If an agency's staff proposes any such change to be presented to the rule-making agency, the staff shall publish the proposed change on the agency's Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted.

(d) Each agency shall determine whether its policies and programs overlap with the policies and programs of another agency. In the event two or more agencies' policies and programs overlap, the agencies shall coordinate the rules adopted by each agency to avoid unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent rules.

(e) Each agency shall quantify the costs and benefits to all parties of a proposed rule to the greatest extent possible. Prior to submission of a proposed rule for publication in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.2, the agency shall review the details of any fiscal note prepared in connection with the proposed rule and approve the fiscal note before submission.

(f) If the agency determines that a proposed rule will have a substantial economic impact as defined in G.S. 150B-21.4(b1), the agency shall consider at least two alternatives to the proposed rule. The alternatives may have been identified by the agency or by members of the public.

(g) Whenever an agency proposes a rule that is purported to implement a federal law, or required by or necessary for compliance with federal law, or on which the receipt of federal funds is conditioned, the agency shall:

- (1) Prepare a certification identifying the federal law requiring adoption of the proposed rule. The certification shall contain a statement setting forth the reasons why the proposed rule is required by federal law. If all or part of the proposed rule is not required by federal law or exceeds the requirements of federal law, then the certification shall state the reasons for that opinion.
- (2) Post the certification on the agency Web site in accordance with subsection (c) of this section.
- (3) Maintain a copy of the federal law and provide to the Office of State Budget and Management the citation to the federal law requiring or pertaining to the proposed rule.

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 2014-120, s. 6(a), effective September 18, 2014, and applicable to proposed rules published on or after that date. (2011-398, s. 2; 2012-187, s. 3; 2013-143, s. 1.1; 2014-120, s. 6(a).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .1202

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - X Lack of statutory authority (in part)
 - X Unclear or ambiguous
 - X Unnecessary (in part)
 - X Failure to comply with the APA (in part)
- Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

*G.S. 150B-19.1(a)(1) states, "An agency may adopt only **rules (emphasis added)** that are expressly authorized by federal and State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest."*

The Rule is riddled with such ambiguous terms as "significant", "unavoidable", "minimized", "adversely" and "interference" that it is difficult to discern whether the agency intends the "Policy Statements" to be a broad policy statement of goals or substantive requirements upon the regulated public.

Further, the agency uses phrases such as "areas of high biological or recreational value" and "shall be minimized" without definition or reference to any statute or code, or supplying criteria upon which to evaluate the same, such that the regulated public, and perhaps the agency employees, cannot determine objectively what the law is.

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .1202 contains broad policy statements, it does not implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, establish any requirements upon any person or entity not employed by the agency, nor does it directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency. Accordingly, it does not meet the definition of a "Rule" pursuant to G.S.150B-2(8a).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

To the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .1202 is not a "Rule", the agency lacks statutory authority to adopt it. Further, the adoption of 15A NCAC 07M .1202 was not in accordance with Article 2A of G.S.150-B as only "Rules" can be adopted. Lastly, to the extent that 15A NCAC 07M .1202 is not a "Rule" it cannot be "reasonably necessary" pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(3) as only "Rules" can be reasonably necessary.

To the extent that the Rule imposes substantive requirements, 15A NCAC 07M .1202, as written, is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

Accordingly, staff counsel recommends that the Rules Review Commission object to 15A NCAC 07M .1202.

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
- a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

§ 150B-19.1. Requirements for agencies in the rule-making process.

(a) In developing and drafting rules for adoption in accordance with this Article, agencies shall adhere to the following principles:

- (1) An agency may adopt only rules that are expressly authorized by federal or State law and that are necessary to serve the public interest.
- (2) An agency shall seek to reduce the burden upon those persons or entities who must comply with the rule.
- (3) Rules shall be written in a clear and unambiguous manner and must be reasonably necessary to implement or interpret federal or State law.
- (4) An agency shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed. The agency shall not adopt a rule that is unnecessary or redundant.
- (5) When appropriate, rules shall be based on sound, reasonably available scientific, technical, economic, and other relevant information. Agencies shall include a reference to this information in the notice of text required by G.S. 150B-21.2(c).
- (6) Rules shall be designed to achieve the regulatory objective in a cost-effective and timely manner.

(b) Each agency subject to this Article shall conduct an annual review of its rules to identify existing rules that are unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent with the principles set forth in subsection (a) of this section. The agency shall repeal any rule identified by this review.

(c) Each agency subject to this Article shall post on its Web site, no later than the publication date of the notice of text in the North Carolina Register, all of the following:

- (1) The text of a proposed rule.
- (2) An explanation of the proposed rule and the reason for the proposed rule.
- (3) The federal certification required by subsection (g) of this section.

- (4) Instructions on how and where to submit oral or written comments on the proposed rule, including a description of the procedure by which a person can object to a proposed rule and subject the proposed rule to legislative review.

- (5) Any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule.

If an agency proposes any change to a rule or fiscal note prior to the date it proposes to adopt a rule, the agency shall publish the proposed change on its Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted. If an agency's staff proposes any such change to be presented to the rule-making agency, the staff shall publish the proposed change on the agency's Web site as soon as practicable after the change is drafted.

(d) Each agency shall determine whether its policies and programs overlap with the policies and programs of another agency. In the event two or more agencies' policies and programs overlap, the agencies shall coordinate the rules adopted by each agency to avoid unnecessary, unduly burdensome, or inconsistent rules.

(e) Each agency shall quantify the costs and benefits to all parties of a proposed rule to the greatest extent possible. Prior to submission of a proposed rule for publication in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.2, the agency shall review the details of any fiscal note prepared in connection with the proposed rule and approve the fiscal note before submission.

(f) If the agency determines that a proposed rule will have a substantial economic impact as defined in G.S. 150B-21.4(b1), the agency shall consider at least two alternatives to the proposed rule. The alternatives may have been identified by the agency or by members of the public.

(g) Whenever an agency proposes a rule that is purported to implement a federal law, or required by or necessary for compliance with federal law, or on which the receipt of federal funds is conditioned, the agency shall:

- (1) Prepare a certification identifying the federal law requiring adoption of the proposed rule. The certification shall contain a statement setting forth the reasons why the proposed rule is required by federal law. If all or part of the proposed rule is not required by federal law or exceeds the requirements of federal law, then the certification shall state the reasons for that opinion.
- (2) Post the certification on the agency Web site in accordance with subsection (c) of this section.
- (3) Maintain a copy of the federal law and provide to the Office of State Budget and Management the citation to the federal law requiring or pertaining to the proposed rule.

(h) Repealed by Session Laws 2014-120, s. 6(a), effective September 18, 2014, and applicable to proposed rules published on or after that date. (2011-398, s. 2; 2012-187, s. 3; 2013-143, s. 1.1; 2014-120, s. 6(a).)

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07H .2305

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - X Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule sets out the specific conditions governing General Permits applicable to bridge and culvert replacement projects over estuarine water or in public trust areas and coastal wetland AEC's.

In staff's opinion, the text of the Rule is unclear and ambiguous as to the limit placed on whether or not the General Permit shall be granted. The limiting language from Rule .2305(b) states that a bridge roadway deck shall not be expanded¹, "provided the proposed project does not create significant adverse impacts."

"[S]ignificant adverse impact" is undefined. It is counsel's position that the phrase is unclear and ambiguous, and this language could be used to deny an applicant's permit. The regulated public must understand exactly what is required of them and by what criteria a permit may be denied.

Coastal Resources has taken the position that this is a term of art, used in other rules, understood by the courts, and "is based on the goals of CAMA which require the CRC to balance the protection of natural resources with development. So, if the development will significantly adversely impact resources, then the two are not balanced." Even though "I know it when I see it" may work for Justice Potter Stewart when identifying obscenity, it is not sufficient for the North Carolina code.

Accordingly, staff recommends that the RRC object to 15A NCAC 07H .2305.

¹ Except a one-lane bridge may be expanded to two lanes.

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0204

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- X Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - X Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - X Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule governs the processing of an application for permits under the Coastal Area Management Act (CAMA) and for fill and dredge permits. In paragraph (b)(1), the agency specifies the requirements for a "complete" application. Among these, the agency requires submission of a "current application form[,] yet does not specify the contents or substantive requirements of the form.

Pursuant to G.S. 150B-2(8a)d., unless the "contents or substantive requirements of [a form] are prescribed by rule or statute" the form itself is subject to rulemaking. In response to requests for changes, the agency confirmed that the contents of the form are not described in another Rule or statute, but declined to revise the Rule to include these contents. Thus, it is staff's opinion that this Rule is subject to objection on the grounds that the agency has failed to comply with the APA.

Additionally, in paragraph (b)(7), the agency requires submission of "any other information the Department or local permit officer deems necessary for a review of the application..." and goes on to note that any application not in compliance will be not be returned and not considered accepted. As written, it appears any application could be deemed incomplete and returned for any reason. Without further description of what kinds of materials or information the Department may require before rejecting and returning a permit application, it is staff's opinion that this provision is impermissibly unclear and ambiguous.

Accordingly, staff recommends that RRC object to 15A NCAC 07J .0204 on the basis that the Rule is unclear and ambiguous, and that the agency has failed to adopt it in compliance with the APA.

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel
September 12, 2022

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter, the following definitions apply:

- (8a) Rule. - Any agency regulation, standard, or statement of general applicability that implements or interprets an enactment of the General Assembly or Congress or a regulation adopted by a federal agency or that describes the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. The term includes the establishment of a fee and the amendment or repeal of a prior rule. The term does not include the following:
- a. Statements concerning only the internal management of an agency or group of agencies within the same principal office or department enumerated in G.S. 143A-11 or 143B-6, including policies and procedures manuals, if the statement does not directly or substantially affect the procedural or substantive rights or duties of a person not employed by the agency or group of agencies.
 - b. Budgets and budget policies and procedures issued by the Director of the Budget, by the head of a department, as defined by G.S. 143A-2 or G.S. 143B-3, or by an occupational licensing board, as defined by G.S. 93B-1.
 - c. Nonbinding interpretative statements within the delegated authority of an agency that merely define, interpret, or explain the meaning of a statute or rule.
 - d. A form, the contents or substantive requirements of which are prescribed by rule or statute.
 - e. Statements of agency policy made in the context of another proceeding, including:
 - 1. Declaratory rulings under G.S. 150B-4.
 - 2. Orders establishing or fixing rates or tariffs.
 - f. Requirements, communicated to the public by the use of signs or symbols, concerning the use of public roads, bridges, ferries, buildings, or facilities.
 - g. Statements that set forth criteria or guidelines to be used by the staff of an agency in performing audits, investigations, or inspections; in settling financial disputes or negotiating financial arrangements; or in the defense, prosecution, or settlement of cases.
 - h. Scientific, architectural, or engineering standards, forms, or procedures, including design criteria and construction standards used to construct or maintain highways, bridges, or ferries.

- i. Job classification standards, job qualifications, and salaries established for positions under the jurisdiction of the State Human Resources Commission.
- j. Establishment of the interest rate that applies to tax assessments under G.S. 105-241.21.
- k. The State Medical Facilities Plan, if the Plan has been prepared with public notice and hearing as provided in G.S. 131E-176(25), reviewed by the Commission for compliance with G.S. 131E-176(25), and approved by the Governor.
- l. Standards adopted by the State Chief Information Officer and applied to information technology as defined in G.S. 143B-1320.

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07J .0210

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

This Rule pertains to the circumstances when CAMA permits are necessary for the replacement of existing structures. Several provisions within the Rule are impermissibly ambiguous. In item (1), the Rule specifies that for non-water dependent structures, proposed work is considered replacement (and thus subject to permitting requirements) "if the cost to do the work exceeds 50 percent of the market value of an existing structure immediately prior to the time of damage or the time of request." It is staff's opinion that as described in the Rule, both the "cost to do the work" and the "market value" are impermissibly unclear or ambiguous.

First, it is unclear who determines whether the market value is determined prior to the time of damage or at the time of the request. In responses to staff's request for changes, the agency stated that "[t]he Division or the Local Permitting Officer" makes the determination. However, the agency declined to make this clarification in the text of the Rule. Further, the Rule gives no guidance as to how this determination is to be made. Market value before and after damage could be markedly different, and thus have a direct impact on whether a permit is necessary.

Additionally, it is unclear what the agency means by "immediately prior to the time of damage." In response to staff's request for changes, the agency stated that it was using the common definition of both words, meaning "without lapse of time and before." Given the unlikely event that a structure may have had its value assessed moments before it was damaged, this answer does little to clarify the issue. The relevant inquiry is how much time may lapse before an appraisal or assessment of the market value is no longer considered "immediately prior to the time of damage." It is similarly unclear if the agency, upon receiving from the applicant an appraisal or assessment that is not

Brian Liebman
Commission Counsel
September 12, 2022

deemed “immediate”, will choose to value the property at the time of request, thus potentially affecting the market value and thus the necessity of a permit.

*Second, the Rule defines the “cost to do the work” as “the cost to return the structure to its pre-damaged condition....” However, the Rule goes on to state that the cost “shall include . . . any improvements that the owner chooses to construct.” The definition of cost cannot simultaneously mean both the cost to return the structure to its pre-damaged condition **and** the cost to make improvements beyond what had previously existed. Although staff asked about this apparent conflict in requests for changes, the agency’s response did not address the conflict.*

Thus, staff recommends that the Commission object to this Rule on the basis that it is impermissibly unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0402

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

Approve, but note staff's comment

X Object, based on:

Lack of statutory authority

X Unclear or ambiguous

Unnecessary

Failure to comply with the APA

Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

Paragraph (a) of the Rule entitled "Definitions", provides a definition of "Impact Assessment". In its original submission, paragraph (a) stated that "the Impact Assessment shall include" and then stated the necessary items. The Coastal Resources Commission deleted "shall include" and replaced it with "includes". In the context of a definition, this changes the listed items from that which must be included in an Impact Assessment to that which may also be considered an Impact Assessment. Accordingly, the adopted rule differs substantially from the proposed rule as it produces an effect that could not reasonably have been expected based upon the proposed rule pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.2(g)(3).

Paragraph (a)(9) requires the Impact Analysis to provide "other specific data required by various state and federal agencies and commissions with jurisdiction to evaluate the consistency of the proposed project with relevant standards and guidelines". This is ambiguous.

The Rule defines the term "Major Energy Facilities" as energy facilities that "have the potential to negatively impact any land or water use or coastal resource of the coastal area." While Rule proceeds to provide a list of facilities that are specifically included, it does not site the listed facilities as examples which would have clarified, limited, and defined the types of facilities the CRC considers having the potential to have negative impact. Further, there is no definition of "negative impact". Accordingly, the agency would have broad discretion in determining which energy facilities are Major Energy Facilities. Any energy facility could become a Major Energy Facility by the arbitrary standard of having the "potential" to have a negative impact.

Accordingly, staff recommends objection to the Rule pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0601

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

Approve, but note staff's comment

X Object, based on:

Lack of statutory authority

X Unclear or ambiguous

Unnecessary

Failure to comply with the APA

Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

The Rule proscribes floating structures "not infringe" upon public trust rights. Staff inquired what the CRC meant by "infringe". The CRC was unresponsive to this inquiry.

As it appears that the CRC cannot articulate with any specificity that which it intends proscribe, the regulated public must rely on the common definition of "infringe". The America Heritage Dictionary defines infringe as : 1. To violate or go beyond the limits of the law, 2. To defeat; invalidate; encroach upon.

On this basis, the Rule is ambiguous. The CRC has adopted a rule that either requires laws to be obeyed which is unnecessary unless the CRC identifies a law or laws not otherwise applicable, or that prohibits floating structures from encroaching in any way upon public trust rights. Pursuant to 15A NCAC 07M .0603, the CRC allows floating structures in "permitted marinas" so an outright prohibition here appears to be in conflict.

Accordingly, staff recommends objection as the Rule is not clear and unambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

§ 1-45.1. No adverse possession of property subject to public trust rights.

Title to real property held by the State and subject to public trust rights may not be acquired by adverse possession. As used in this section, "public trust rights" means those rights held in trust by the State for the use and benefit of the people of the State in common. They are established by common law as interpreted by the courts of this State. They include, but are not limited to, the right to navigate, swim, hunt, fish, and enjoy all recreational activities in the watercourses of the State and the right to freely use and enjoy the State's ocean and estuarine beaches and public access to the beaches. (1985, c. 277, s. 1.)

15A NCAC 07M .0603 POLICY STATEMENTS

(A) IT IS THE POLICY OF THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA THAT FLOATING STRUCTURES SHALL NOT BE ALLOWED OR PERMITTED WITHIN THE PUBLIC TRUST WATERS OF THE COASTAL AREA EXCEPT IN PERMITTED MARINAS. (B) ALL FLOATING STRUCTURES SHALL BE IN CONFORMANCE WITH LOCAL REGULATIONS FOR ON-SHORE SEWAGE TREATMENT. HISTORY NOTE: AUTHORITY G.S. 113A-102; 113A-107; 113A-108; 113A-118; 113A-120(A)(8); 113A-124(C)(5); EFF. JULY 1, 1983.

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0603

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

Approve, but note staff's comment

X Object, based on:

Lack of statutory authority

X Unclear or ambiguous

Unnecessary

Failure to comply with the APA

Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

THE RULE PROHIBITS FLOATING STRUCTURES IN PUBLIC TRUST WATERS OF THE COASTAL AREA "EXCEPT IN PERMITTED MARINAS".

CONTEXTUALLY, THE PHRASE "EXCEPT IN PERMITTED MARINAS" COULD MEAN DIFFERENT THINGS. MUST THE MARINAS HAVE PERMITS? MUST THE MARINAS HAVE PERMITS FOR A FLOATING STRUCTURE? MUST THE OWNER OF A FLOATING STRUCTURE HAVE A PERMIT? IF PERMITS ARE REQUIRED, BY WHAT PROCESS? OR PERHAPS THE WORD "PERMITTED" IS UNNECESSARY OR A POOR CHOICE OF WORDS.

"PERMITTED MARINAS" IS NOT A DEFINED TERM. STAFF INQUIRED OF THE CRC BY WHAT PROCEDURE PERMITS WERE ACQUIRED. CRC RESPONDED INTER ALIA THAT "MARINAS ARE PERMITTED PURSUANT TO 15A NCAC 7H .0208(B)(5)." HOWEVER, RULE .0208(B)(5) DOES NOT CONTAIN A PERMIT PROCESS. WHILE IT IS CLEAR THAT FLOATING STRUCTURES ARE LAWFUL WITHIN SOME AREAS OF THE PUBLIC TRUST WATER; HOWEVER, IT IS UNCLEAR WHERE.

THE CRC ADDED PARAGRAPH (C) POST PUBLICATION AND ABSENT ANY REQUEST CHANGES BY STAFF. THE LANGUAGE OF (C) IS THE SAME AS 15A NCAC 07M .0602; HOWEVER, RULE .0602 IS INTER ALIA A DEFINITION OF "FLOATING STRUCTURE" USING SIMILAR LANGUAGE TO G.S. 113A-103(5A)1. HERE THE CRC, OUTSIDE THE DEFINITION CONTEXT, IS STATING THAT A BOAT "MAY BE DEEMED A FLOATING STRUCTURE" (EMPHASIS ADDED) WITHOUT PROVIDING ANY CRITERIA UPON WHICH THE AGENCY WILL BASE ITS DISCRETION. IF THERE IS NO OTHER CRITERIA, "MAY" SHOULD BE "SHALL". AS WRITTEN, PARAGRAPH (C) IS AMBIGUOUS.

1 G.S. 113A-103(5A) STATES A BOAT MAY BE "CONSIDERED" A FLOATING STRUCTURE. RULES .0602 AND .0603 USE THE WORD "DEEMED".

WILLIAM W. PEASLEE
COMMISSION COUNSEL

ACCORDINGLY, STAFF RECOMMENDS OBJECTION TO THE RULE AS THE RULE IS NOT CLEAR AND UNAMBIGUOUS PURSUANT TO G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

*WILLIAM W. PEASLEE
COMMISSION COUNSEL*

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

15A NCAC 07H .0208 (b) (5) Marinas. "Marinas" are defined as any publicly or privately owned dock, basin or wet boat storage facility constructed to accommodate more than 10 boats and providing any of the following services: permanent or transient docking spaces, dry storage, fueling facilities, haulout facilities, and repair service. Excluded from this definition are boat ramp facilities allowing access only, temporary docking, and none of the preceding services. Expansion of existing facilities shall comply with the standards of this Subparagraph for all development other than maintenance and repair necessary to maintain previous service levels. Marinas shall comply with the following standards: (A) Marinas shall be sited in non-wetland areas or in deep waters (areas not requiring dredging) and shall not disturb shellfish resources, submerged aquatic vegetation as defined by the MFC, or wetland habitats, except for dredging necessary for access to high-ground sites. The following four alternatives for siting marinas are listed in order of preference for the least damaging alternative; marina projects shall be designed to have the highest of these four priorities that is deemed feasible by the permit letting agency: (i) an upland basin site requiring no alteration of wetland or estuarine habitat and providing flushing by tidal or wind generated water circulation or basin design characteristics; (ii) an upland basin site requiring dredging for access when the necessary dredging and operation of the marina will not result in significant adverse impacts to existing fishery, shellfish, or wetland resources and the basin design shall provide flushing by tidal or wind generated water circulation; (iii) an open water site located outside a primary nursery area which utilizes piers or docks rather than channels or canals to reach deeper water; and (iv) an open water marina requiring excavation of no intertidal habitat, and no dredging greater than the depth of the connecting channel. (B) Marinas that require dredging shall not be located in primary nursery areas nor in areas which require dredging through primary nursery areas for access. Maintenance dredging in primary nursery areas for existing marinas shall comply with the standards set out in Part (b)(1)(I) of this Rule; (C) To minimize coverage of public trust areas by docks and moored vessels, dry storage marinas shall be used where feasible; (D) Marinas to be developed in waters subject to public trust rights (other than those created by dredging upland basins or canals) for the purpose of providing docking for residential developments shall be allowed no more than 27 square feet of public trust areas for every one linear foot of shoreline adjacent to these public trust areas for construction of docks and mooring facilities. The 27 square feet allocation does not apply to fairway areas between parallel piers or any portion of the pier used only for access from land to the docking spaces; (E) To protect water quality in shellfishing areas, marinas shall not be located within areas where shellfish harvesting for human consumption is a significant existing use or adjacent to such areas if shellfish harvest closure is anticipated to result from the location of the marina. In compliance with 33 U.S. Code Section 101(a)(2) of the Clean Water Act and North Carolina Water Quality Standards (15A NCAC 02B .0200) adopted pursuant to that section, shellfish harvesting is a significant existing use if it can be established that shellfish have been regularly harvested for human consumption since November 28, 1975 or that shellfish are propagating and surviving in a biologically suitable habitat and are available and suitable for harvesting for the purpose of human consumption. The Division of Coastal Management shall consult with the Division of Marine Fisheries regarding the significance of shellfish harvest as an existing use and the magnitude of the quantities of shellfish that have been harvested or are available for harvest in the area where harvest will be affected by the development; (F) Marinas shall not be located without written consent from the leaseholders or owners of submerged lands that have been leased from the state or deeded by the State; (G) Marina basins shall be designed to promote flushing through the following design criteria: (i) the basin and channel depths shall gradually increase toward open water and shall never be deeper than the waters to which they connect; and (ii) when possible, an opening shall be provided at

opposite ends of the basin to establish flow-through circulation; (H) Marinas shall be designed so that the capability of the waters to be used for navigation or for other public trust rights in estuarine or public trust waters are not jeopardized while allowing the applicant access to deep waters; (I) Marinas shall be located and constructed so as to avoid adverse impacts on navigation throughout all federally maintained channels and their boundaries as designated by the US Army Corps of Engineers. This includes permanent or temporary mooring sites; speed or traffic reductions; or any other device, either physical or regulatory, that may cause a federally maintained channel to be restricted; (J) Open water marinas shall not be enclosed within breakwaters that preclude circulation sufficient to maintain water quality; (K) Marinas that require dredging shall provide areas in accordance with Part (b)(1)(B) of this Rule to accommodate disposal needs for future maintenance dredging, including the ability to remove the dredged material from the marina site; (L) Marina design shall comply with all applicable EMC requirements (15A NCAC 02B .0200) for management of stormwater runoff. Stormwater management systems shall not be located within the 30-foot buffer area outlined in 15A NCAC 07H .0209(d); (M) Marinas shall post a notice prohibiting the discharge of any waste from boat toilets and listing the availability of local pump-out services; (N) Boat maintenance areas shall be designed so that all scraping, sandblasting, and painting will be done over dry land with collection and containment devices that prevent entry of waste materials into adjacent waters; (O) All marinas shall comply with all applicable standards for docks and piers, shoreline stabilization, dredging and dredged material disposal of this Rule; (P) All applications for marinas shall be reviewed by the Division of Coastal Management to determine their potential impact to coastal resources and compliance with applicable standards of this Rule. Such review shall also consider the cumulative impacts of marina development in accordance with G.S. 113A-120(a)(10); and (Q) Replacement of existing marinas to maintain previous service levels shall be allowed provided that the development complies with the standards for marina development within this Section

15A NCAC 07M .0602 DEFINITIONS (a) A boat is a vessel or watercraft of any type or size specifically designed to be self-propelled, whether by engine, sail, oar, or paddle or other means, which is used to travel from place to place by water. (b) A "floating structure" is any structure, not a boat, supported by a means of flotation, designed to be used without a permanent foundation, which is used or intended for human habitation or commerce. A structure will be considered a floating structure when it is inhabited or used for commercial purposes for more than thirty days in any one location. A boat may be deemed a floating structure when its means of propulsion has been removed or rendered inoperative and it contains at least 200 square feet of living space area. History Note: Authority G.S. 113A-102; 113A-107; 113A-108; 113A-118; 113A-120(a)(8); 113A-124(c)(5); Eff. July 1, 1983

§ 113A-103. Definitions.

As used in this Article:

- (1) "Advisory Council" means the Coastal Resources Advisory Council created by G.S. 113A-105.
- (1a) "Boat" means a vessel or watercraft of any type or size specifically designed to be self-propelled, whether by engine, sail, oar, or paddle or other means, which is used to travel from place to place by water.
- (2) "Coastal area" means the counties that (in whole or in part) are adjacent to, adjoining, intersected by or bounded by the Atlantic Ocean (extending offshore to the limits of State jurisdiction, as may be identified by rule of the Commission for purposes of this Article, but in no event less than three geographical miles offshore) or any coastal sound. The Governor, in accordance with the standards set forth in this subdivision and in subdivision (3) of this section, shall designate the counties that constitute the "coastal area," as defined by this section, and his designation shall be final and conclusive. On or before May 1, 1974, the Governor shall file copies of a list of said coastal-area counties with the chairmen of the boards of commissioners of each county in the coastal area, with the mayors of each incorporated city within the coastal area (as so defined) having a population of 2,000 or more and of each incorporated city having a population of less than 2,000 whose corporate boundaries are contiguous with the Atlantic Ocean, and with the Secretary of State. By way of illustration, the counties designated as coastal-area counties under this subdivision as of July 1, 2012, are Beaufort, Bertie, Brunswick, Camden, Carteret, Chowan, Craven, Currituck, Dare, Gates, Hertford, Hyde, New Hanover, Onslow, Pamlico, Pasquotank, Pender, Perquimans, Tyrrell, and Washington. The coastal-area counties and cities shall transmit nominations to the Governor of members of the Coastal Resources Commission as provided in G.S. 113A-104(d).
- (3) "Coastal sound" means Albemarle, Bogue, Core, Croatan, Currituck, Pamlico and Roanoke Sounds. For purposes of this Article, the inland limits of a sound on a tributary river shall be defined as the limits of seawater encroachment on said tributary river under normal conditions. "Normal conditions" shall be understood to include regularly occurring conditions of low stream flow and high tide, but shall not include unusual conditions such as those associated with hurricane and other storm tides. Unless otherwise determined by the Commission, the limits of seawater encroachment shall be considered to be the confluence of a sound's tributary river with the river or creek entering it nearest to the farthest inland movement of oceanic salt water under normal conditions.

For purposes of this Article, the aforementioned points of confluence with tributary rivers shall include the following:

- a. On the Chowan River, its confluence with the Meherrin River;
- b. On the Roanoke River, its confluence with the northeast branch of the Cashie River;
- c. On the Tar River, its confluence with Tranters Creek;
- d. On the Neuse River, its confluence with Swift Creek;
- e. On the Trent River, its confluence with Ready Branch.

Provided, however, that no county shall be considered to be within the coastal area which: (i) is adjacent to, adjoining or bounded by any of the above points of confluence and lies entirely west of said point of confluence; or (ii) is not bounded by the Atlantic Ocean and lies entirely west of the westernmost of the above points of confluence.

(4) "Commission" means the Coastal Resources Commission created by G.S. 113A-104.

(4a) "Department" means the Department of Environmental Quality.

(5) a. "Development" means any activity in a duly designated area of environmental concern (except as provided in paragraph b of this subdivision) involving, requiring, or consisting of the construction or enlargement of a structure; excavation; dredging; filling; dumping; removal of clay, silt, sand, gravel or minerals; bulkheading, driving of pilings; clearing or alteration of land as an adjunct of construction; alteration or removal of sand dunes; alteration of the shore, bank, or bottom of the Atlantic Ocean or any sound, bay, river, creek, stream, lake, or canal; or placement of a floating structure in an area of environmental concern identified in G.S. 113A-113(b)(2) or (b)(5).

b. The following activities including the normal and incidental operations associated therewith shall not be deemed to be development under this section:

- 1. Work by a highway or road agency for the maintenance of an existing road, if the work is carried out on land within the boundaries of the existing right-of-way, or for emergency repairs and safety enhancements of an existing road as described in an executive order issued under G.S. 166A-19.30(a)(5).
- 2. Work by any railroad company or by any utility and other persons engaged in the distribution and transmission of petroleum products, water, telephone or telegraph messages, or electricity for the purpose of inspecting, repairing, maintaining, or upgrading any existing

substations, sewers, mains, pipes, cables, utility tunnels, lines, towers, poles, tracks, and the like on any of its existing railroad or utility property or rights-of-way, or the extension of any of the above distribution-related facilities to serve development approved pursuant to G.S. 113A-121 or 113A-122;

3. Work by any utility and other persons for the purpose of construction of facilities for the development, generation, and transmission of energy to the extent that such activities are regulated by other law or by present or future rules of the State Utilities Commission regulating the siting of such facilities (including environmental aspects of such siting), and work on facilities used directly in connection with the above facilities;
4. The use of any land for the purposes of planting, growing, or harvesting plants, crops, trees, or other agricultural or forestry products, including normal private road construction, raising livestock or poultry, or for other agricultural purposes except where excavation or filling affecting estuarine waters (as defined in G.S. 113-229) or navigable waters is involved;
5. Maintenance or repairs (excluding replacement) necessary to repair damage to structures caused by the elements or to prevent damage to imminently threatened structures by the creation of protective sand dunes.
6. The construction of any accessory building customarily incident to an existing structure if the work does not involve filling, excavation, or the alteration of any sand dune or beach;
7. Completion of any development, not otherwise in violation of law, for which a valid building or zoning permit was issued prior to ratification of this Article and which development was initiated prior to the ratification of this Article;
8. Completion of installation of any utilities or roads or related facilities not otherwise in violation of law, within a subdivision that was duly approved and recorded prior to the ratification of this Article and which installation was initiated prior to the ratification of this Article;
9. Construction or installation of any development, not otherwise in violation of law, for which an application for

a building or zoning permit was pending prior to the ratification of this Article and for which a loan commitment (evidenced by a notarized document signed by both parties) had been made prior to the ratification of this Article; provided, said building or zoning application is granted by July 1, 1974;

10. It is the intention of the General Assembly that if the provisions of any of the foregoing subparagraphs 1 to 10 of this paragraph are held invalid as a grant of an exclusive or separate emolument or privilege or as a denial of the equal protection of the laws, within the meaning of Article I, Secs. 19 and 32 of the North Carolina Constitution, the remainder of this Article shall be given effect without the invalid provision or provisions.

c. The Commission shall define by rule (and may revise from time to time) certain classes of minor maintenance and improvements which shall be exempted from the permit requirements of this Article, in addition to the exclusions set forth in paragraph b of this subdivision. In developing such rules the Commission shall consider, with regard to the class or classes of units to be exempted:

1. The size of the improved or scope of the maintenance work;
2. The location of the improvement or work in proximity to dunes, waters, marshlands, areas of high seismic activity, areas of unstable soils or geologic formations, and areas enumerated in G.S. 113A-113(b)(3); and
3. Whether or not dredging or filling is involved in the maintenance or improvement.

(5a) "Floating structure" means any structure, not a boat, supported by a means of floatation, designed to be used without a permanent foundation, which is used or intended for human habitation or commerce. A structure shall be considered a floating structure when it is inhabited or used for commercial purposes for more than thirty days in any one location. A boat may be considered a floating structure when its means of propulsion has been removed or rendered inoperative.

(6) "Key facilities" include the site location and the location of major improvement and major access features of key facilities, and mean:

- a. Public facilities, as determined by the Commission, on nonfederal lands which tend to induce development and

urbanization of more than local impact, including but not limited to:

1. Any major airport designed to serve as a terminal for regularly scheduled air passenger service or one of State concern;
 2. Major interchanges between the interstate highway system and frontage-access streets or highways; major interchanges between other limited-access highways and frontage-access streets or highways;
 3. Major frontage-access streets and highways, both of State concern; and
 4. Major recreational lands and facilities;
- b. Major facilities on nonfederal lands for the development, generation, and transmission of energy.
- (7) "Lead regional organizations" means the regional planning agencies created by and representative of the local governments of a multi-county region, and designated as lead regional organizations by the Governor.
- (8) "Local government" means the governing body of any county or city which contains within its boundaries any lands or waters subject to this Article.
- (9) "Person" means any individual, citizen, partnership, corporation, association, organization, business trust, estate, trust, public or municipal corporation, or agency of the State or local government unit, or any other legal entity however designated.
- (10) Repealed by Session Laws 1987, c. 827, s. 133.
- (11) "Secretary" means the Secretary of Environmental Quality, except where otherwise specified in this Article. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1981, c. 913, s. 1; c. 932, s. 2.1; 1987, c. 827, s. 133; 1989, c. 727, s. 126; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, ss. 1, 4; 1995, c. 509, s. 58; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2012-202, s. 1; 2014-100, s. 14.7(l); 2015-241, s. 14.30(u), (v).)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0703

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

Paragraph (a) describes when the CRC "may" approve a development plan. The Rule does not state when the CRC shall approve a development plan or any criteria which will be considered in making its determination. It is unclear whether the agency is listing the prequalifications for consideration of a plan, or the criteria which will be considered.

In Paragraph (b) the CRC states that mitigation "may" also be the basis for CRC approval of project if the CRC determines that public benefits to the environment outweigh environmental losses. The Rule does not address what criteria it will use in making this determination nor is there a reference to another rule containing the criteria. The Rule does not state upon what other basis CRC approval of projects shall be granted.

The use of the word "may" provides the CRC gross discretion without stating the criteria upon which it will consider a development project for mitigation or whether a project's benefits outweigh environmental issues.

Staff recommends objection for lack of clarity and ambiguousness pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .0704

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☒ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☐ Failure to comply with the APA
- ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

Generally, the Rule reads more like a broad policy statement than rules placing substantive requirements on any entity. To the extent that the Rule places requirements on an entity, the requirements are unclear and ambiguous.

Paragraph (a) includes a list of forms of mitigation "in order of preference". The Rule does not identify whose preference. Thereafter, the list includes ambiguous descriptions of the types of mitigation. i.e. "systems determined to be more productive" and the creation of areas of "similar ecological utility and potential biological value". The Rule is silent on how the determinations and values will be made or the criteria which will be used.

Subparagraph (a)(4) departs from the list and addresses that which "will shall be considered" sic and "may be used in combination with" subparagraphs (a)(1)-(3). Presumably it is the agency which will take this under consideration; however, the criteria upon which it will be based is not addressed.

Paragraph (b) states that mitigation proposals "may be the basis for approval of a development..." Again, the Rule does not address the criteria which will be used in making the determination.

Paragraph (d) attempts to make the enforcement options provided in G.S. 113A-126 applicable to "permit conditions according to G.S. 113A-120(b)". G.S. 113A-126(a) provides for injunctive relief and penalties for a "violation of any of the provisions of [Article 7 of Chapter 113A] or of any rule or order adopted under the authority of this article ..." G.S. 113A-126(b) penalties for a "violation of

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

any of the provisions of [Article 7 of Chapter 113A] relating to permits for minor developments issued by a local government, or of any rule or order adopted under the authority of this article relating to such permits..." It does not appear that permit conditions are enforceable under G.S. 113A-126. Accordingly, staff recommends objection to the Rule as the agency lacks authority pursuant G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(1).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

§ 113A-120. Grant or denial of permits.

(a) The responsible official or body shall deny an application for a permit upon finding:

- (1) In the case of coastal wetlands, that the development would contravene an order that has been or could be issued pursuant to G.S. 113-230.
- (2) In the case of estuarine waters, that a permit for the development would be denied pursuant to G.S. 113-229(e).
- (3) In the case of a renewable resource area, that the development will result in loss or significant reduction of continued long-range productivity that would jeopardize one or more of the water, food or fiber requirements of more than local concern identified in subdivisions a through c of G.S. 113A-113(b)(3).
- (4) In the case of a fragile or historic area, or other area containing environmental or natural resources of more than local significance, that the development will result in major or irreversible damage to one or more of the historic, cultural, scientific, environmental or scenic values or natural systems identified in subdivisions a through h of G.S. 113A-113(b)(4).
- (5) In the case of areas covered by G.S. 113A-113(b)(5), that the development will jeopardize the public rights or interests specified in said subdivision.
- (6) In the case of natural hazard areas, that the development would occur in one or more of the areas identified in subdivisions a through e of G.S. 113A-113(b)(6) in such a manner as to unreasonably endanger life or property.
- (7) In the case of areas which are or may be impacted by key facilities, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans, or would contravene any of the provisions of subdivisions (1) to (6) of this subsection.
- (8) In any case, that the development is inconsistent with the State guidelines or the local land-use plans.
- (9) In any case, that considering engineering requirements and all economic costs there is a practicable alternative that would accomplish the overall project purposes with less adverse impact on the public resources.
- (10) In any case, that the proposed development would contribute to cumulative effects that would be inconsistent with the guidelines set forth in subdivisions (1) through (9) of this subsection. Cumulative effects are impacts attributable to the collective effects of a number of projects and include the effects of additional projects similar to the requested permit in areas available for development in the vicinity.

(b) In the absence of such findings, a permit shall be granted. The permit may be conditioned upon the applicant's amending his proposal to take whatever measures or agreeing to carry out whatever terms of operation or use of the development that are reasonably necessary to protect the public interest with respect to the factors enumerated in subsection (a) of this section.

(b1) In addition to those factors set out in subsection (a) of this section, and notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (b) of this section, the responsible official or body may deny an application for a permit upon finding that an applicant, or any parent or subsidiary corporation if the applicant is a corporation:

- (1) Is conducting or has conducted any activity causing significant environmental damage for which a major development permit is required under this Article without having previously obtained such permit or has received a notice of

violation with respect to any activity governed by this Article and has not complied with the notice within the time specified in the notice;

- (2) Has failed to pay a civil penalty assessed pursuant to this Article, a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article, or Article 17 of Chapter 113 of the General Statutes which is due and for which no appeal is pending;
- (3) Has been convicted of a misdemeanor pursuant to G.S. 113A-126, G.S. 113-229(k), or any criminal provision of a local ordinance adopted pursuant to this Article; or
- (4) Has failed to substantially comply with State rules or local ordinances and regulations adopted pursuant to this Article or with other federal and state laws, regulations, and rules for the protection of the environment.

(b2) For purposes of subsection (b1) of this section, an applicant's record may be considered for only the two years prior to the application date.

(c) Repealed by Session Laws 1989, c. 676, s. 7. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 518, ss. 4, 5; 1987, c. 827, s. 138; 1989, c. 51; c. 676, s. 7; 1997-337, s. 2; 1997-456, s. 55.2B; 1997-496, s. 2; 2000-172, s. 2.1.)

§ 113A-126. Injunctive relief and penalties.

(a) Upon violation of any of the provisions of this Article or of any rule or order adopted under the authority of this Article the Secretary may, either before or after the institution of proceedings for the collection of any penalty imposed by this Article for such violation, institute a civil action in the General Court of Justice in the name of the State upon the relation of the Secretary for injunctive relief to restrain the violation and for a preliminary and permanent mandatory injunction to restore the resources consistent with this Article and rules of the Commission. If the court finds that a violation is threatened or has occurred, the court shall, at a minimum, order the relief necessary to prevent the threatened violation or to abate the violation consistent with this Article and rules of the Commission. Neither the institution of the action nor any of the proceedings thereon shall relieve any party to such proceedings from any penalty prescribed by this Article for any violation of same.

(b) Upon violation of any of the provisions of this Article relating to permits for minor developments issued by a local government, or of any rule or order adopted under the authority of this Article relating to such permits, the designated local official may, either before or after the institution of proceedings for the collection of any penalty imposed by this Article for such violation, institute a civil action in the General Court of Justice in the name of the affected local government upon the relation of the designated local official for injunctive relief to restrain the violation and for a preliminary and permanent mandatory injunction to restore the resources consistent with this Article and rules of the Commission. If the court finds that a violation is threatened or has occurred, the court shall, at a minimum, order the relief necessary to prevent the threatened violation or to abate the violation consistent with this Article and rules of the Commission. Neither the institution of the action nor any of the proceedings thereon shall relieve any party to such proceedings from any penalty prescribed by this Article for any violation of same.

(c) Any person who shall be adjudged to have knowingly or willfully violated any provision of this Article, or any rule or order adopted pursuant to this Article, shall be guilty of a Class 2 misdemeanor. In addition, if any person continues to violate or further violates, any such provision, rule or order after written notice from the Secretary or (in the case of a permit for a minor development issued by a local government) written notice from the designated local official, the court may determine that each day during which the violation continues or is repeated constitutes a separate violation subject to the foregoing penalties.

(d) (1) A civil penalty of not more than one thousand dollars (\$1,000) for a minor development violation and ten thousand dollars (\$10,000) for a major development violation may be assessed by the Commission against any person who:

- a. Is required but fails to apply for or to secure a permit required by G.S. 113A-118, or who violates or fails to act in accordance with the terms, conditions, or requirements of such permit.
 - b. Fails to file, submit, or make available, as the case may be, any documents, data or reports required by the Commission pursuant to this Article.
 - c. Refuses access to the Commission or its duly designated representative, who has sufficiently identified himself by displaying official credentials, to any premises, not including any occupied dwelling house or curtilage, for the purpose of conducting any investigations provided for in this Article.
 - d. Violates a rule of the Commission implementing this Article.
- (2) For each willful action or failure to act for which a penalty may be assessed under this subsection, the Commission may consider each day the action or inaction continues after notice is given of the violation as a separate violation; a separate penalty may be assessed for each such separate violation.
- (3) The Commission shall notify a person who is assessed a penalty or investigative costs by registered or certified mail. The notice shall state the reasons for the penalty. A person may contest the assessment of a penalty or investigative costs by filing a petition for a contested case under G.S. 150B-23 within 20 days after receiving the notice of assessment. If a person fails to pay any civil penalty or investigative cost assessed under this subsection, the Commission shall refer the matter to the Attorney General for collection. An action to collect a penalty must be filed within three years after the date the final decision was served on the violator.
- (4) In determining the amount of the civil penalty, the Commission shall consider the following factors:
- a. The degree and extent of harm, including, but not limited to, harm to the natural resources of the State, to the public health, or to private property resulting from the violation;
 - b. The duration and gravity of the violation;
 - c. The effect on water quality, coastal resources, or public trust uses;
 - d. The cost of rectifying the damage;
 - e. The amount of money saved by noncompliance;
 - f. Whether the violation was committed willfully or intentionally;
 - g. The prior record of the violator in complying or failing to comply with programs over which the Commission has regulatory authority; and

- h. The cost to the State of the enforcement procedures.
- (4a) The Commission may also assess a person who is assessed a civil penalty under this subsection the reasonable costs of any investigation, inspection, or monitoring that results in the assessment of the civil penalty. For a minor development violation, the amount of an assessment of investigative costs shall not exceed one-half of the amount of the civil penalty assessed or one thousand dollars (\$1,000), whichever is less. For a major development violation, the amount of an assessment of investigative costs shall not exceed one-half of the amount of the civil penalty assessed or two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500), whichever is less.
- (5) The clear proceeds of penalties assessed pursuant to this subsection shall be remitted to the Civil Penalty and Forfeiture Fund in accordance with G.S. 115C-457.2. (1973, c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 485, ss. 1-3; c. 518, s. 6; 1987, c. 827, ss. 11, 143; 1991, c. 725, s. 6; 1991 (Reg. Sess., 1992), c. 839, s. 3; c. 890, s. 8; 1993, c. 539, s. 874; 1994, Ex. Sess., c. 24, s. 14(c); 1998-215, s. 53(a); 2006-229, s. 1; 2011-398, s. 38.)

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .1002

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

Approve, but note staff's comment

X Object, based on:

X Lack of statutory authority

X Unclear or ambiguous

Unnecessary

Failure to comply with the APA

Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

Paragraph (a) requires "public trust waters subject to water restrictions pursuant to 33 USC 3 shall be opened to commercial fishing". It is unclear what, if any, authority the CRC has over 33 USC 3 waters as they appear to be under the authority of the United States Secretary of the Army. Further, the requirement that the water be open "at established times" is ambiguous.

Paragraph (b) appears to require "the area of restricted surface waters" to be as large as the "recommended laser safety zone under 33 USCS 3" where laser weaponry is used. In response to staff's inquiry, the CRC identified the Secretary of the United States Army as the authority which establishes the "area of restricted waters". It is unclear what, if any, authority the CRC has over the Secretary of the Army.

Paragraph (c) requires water quality to be tested periodically but fails to identify who is required to conduct the test.

Accordingly, staff recommends objection to the Rule as the Rule is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2), and the agency lacks authority to adopt the Rule pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(1).

William W. Peaslee
Commission Counsel

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

§ 3. Regulations to prevent injuries from target practice

Currentness

Authority to adopt regulations. In the interest of the national defense, and for the better protection of life and property on the navigable waters of the United States, **the Secretary of the Army is authorized and empowered to prescribe such regulations** as he may deem best for the use and navigation of any portion or area of the navigable waters of the United States or waters under the jurisdiction of the United States endangered or likely to be endangered by Artillery fire in target practice or otherwise, or by the proving operations of the Government ordnance proving grounds at Sandy Hook, New Jersey, or at any Government ordnance proving ground that may be established elsewhere on or near such waters, and of any portion or area of said waters occupied by submarine mines, mine fields, submarine cables, or other material and accessories pertaining to seacoast fortifications, or by any plant or facility engaged in the execution of any public project of river and harbor improvement; and the said Secretary shall have like power to regulate the transportation of explosives upon any of said waters: *Provided*, That the authority conferred shall be so exercised as not unreasonably to interfere with or restrict the food fishing industry, and the regulations prescribed in pursuance hereof shall provide for the use of such waters by food fishermen operating under permits granted by the Department of the Army.

Detail of vessels to enforce regulations. To enforce the regulations prescribed pursuant to this section, the Secretary of the Army, may detail any public vessel in the service of the Department of the Army, or, upon the request of the Secretary of the Army, the head of any other department may enforce, and the head of any such department is authorized to enforce, such regulations by means of any public vessel of such department.

Posting and violation of regulations. The regulations made by the Secretary of the Army pursuant to this section shall be posted in conspicuous and appropriate places, designated by him, for the information of the public; and every person who and every corporation which shall willfully violate any regulations made by the said Secretary pursuant to this section shall be deemed guilty of a misdemeanor, and upon conviction thereof in any court of competent jurisdiction shall be punished by a fine not exceeding \$500, or by imprisonment (in the case of a natural person) not exceeding six months, in the discretion of the court.

Venue and jurisdiction of offenses; procedure. Offenses against the provisions of this section, or any regulation made pursuant thereto, committed in any Territory or other place subject to the jurisdiction of the United States where there is no court having general jurisdiction of crimes against the United States, shall be cognizable in any court of such place or Territory having original jurisdiction of criminal cases in the place or Territory in which the offense has been committed, with the same right of appeal in all cases as is given in other criminal cases where imprisonment not exceeding six months forms a part of the penalty, and jurisdiction is conferred upon such courts and such courts shall exercise the same for such purposes; and in case any such offense be committed beyond the territorial jurisdiction of any court having jurisdiction thereof, the offense shall be deemed and held to have been committed within the jurisdiction in which the offender may be found or into which he is first brought, and shall be tried by the court having jurisdiction thereof.

RRC STAFF OPINION

PLEASE NOTE: THIS COMMUNICATION IS EITHER 1) ONLY THE RECOMMENDATION OF AN RRC STAFF ATTORNEY AS TO ACTION THAT THE ATTORNEY BELIEVES THE COMMISSION SHOULD TAKE ON THE CITED RULE AT ITS NEXT MEETING, OR 2) AN OPINION OF THAT ATTORNEY AS TO SOME MATTER CONCERNING THAT RULE. THE AGENCY AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ARE INVITED TO SUBMIT THEIR OWN COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (ACCORDING TO RRC RULES) TO THE COMMISSION.

AGENCY: Coastal Resources Commission

RULE CITATION: 15A NCAC 07M .1102

RECOMMENDED ACTION: September 12, 2022

- ☐ Approve, but note staff's comment
- ☒ Object, based on:
 - ☐ Lack of statutory authority
 - ☒ Unclear or ambiguous
 - ☐ Unnecessary
 - ☒ Failure to comply with the APA
 - ☐ Extend the period of review

COMMENT:

Paragraph (a) prohibits "clean, beach quality material" from being removed from listed yet undefined areas¹, "unless no practical alternative exists". "Beach quality material" is undefined and there is no reference to any statute, rule, or description referenced. Further, the Rule does not address who will determine whether or not a practical alternative exists or what criteria should be considered in making this determination.

Paragraph (b) does not appear to place any substantive requirement on anyone. Accordingly, Paragraph (b) does not meet the definition of a "Rule" and therefore cannot be adopted.

Paragraph (c) makes "material in [public] disposal sites" available for "a beneficial use" not inconsistent with Paragraph (a). Contextually this is referring to dredged material but it could be made clear. Who will make the determination whether the "use" is "beneficial" and what criteria will be used in making the determination is not addressed.

Paragraph (d), as amended, requires the restoration of estuarine waters and public trust waters be consistent with "G.S. 113A-18(f)" which does not appear to exist. Assuming the CRC intended G.S. 113A-118(f), which is cited in the history note, Paragraph (d) would require restoration be consistent with the issuance of special emergency permits by the Secretary of the Department of Environmental Quality "in those extraordinary situations in which life or structural property is in

¹ THE CRC CLAIMS THAT THE TERMS USED TO DESCRIBE THE AREAS ARE UNDERSTOOD BY THE REGULATED PUBLIC.

imminent danger as a result of storms, sudden failure of man-made structures, or similar occurrence". (see G.S. 113A-118(f)) It is unclear what the CRC is requiring or under what circumstances.

Accordingly, staff recommends objection to the Rule as the Rule is unclear and ambiguous pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(2), and the Rule was not adopted in accordance with Part 2 of Article 2A pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(4).

§ 150B-21.9. Standards and timetable for review by Commission.

(a) Standards. - The Commission must determine whether a rule meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) It is within the authority delegated to the agency by the General Assembly.
- (2) It is clear and unambiguous.
- (3) It is reasonably necessary to implement or interpret an enactment of the General Assembly, or of Congress, or a regulation of a federal agency. The Commission shall consider the cumulative effect of all rules adopted by the agency related to the specific purpose for which the rule is proposed.
- (4) It was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

The Commission shall not consider questions relating to the quality or efficacy of the rule but shall restrict its review to determination of the standards set forth in this subsection.

The Commission may ask the Office of State Budget and Management to determine if a rule has a substantial economic impact and is therefore required to have a fiscal note. The Commission must ask the Office of State Budget and Management to make this determination if a fiscal note was not prepared for a rule and the Commission receives a written request for a determination of whether the rule has a substantial economic impact.

(a1) Entry of a rule in the North Carolina Administrative Code after review by the Commission creates a rebuttable presumption that the rule was adopted in accordance with Part 2 of this Article.

(b) Timetable. - The Commission must review a permanent rule submitted to it on or before the twentieth of a month by the last day of the next month. The Commission must review a rule submitted to it after the twentieth of a month by the last day of the second subsequent month. The Commission must review a temporary rule in accordance with the timetable and procedure set forth in G.S. 150B-21.1. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(f); 2000-140, s. 93.1(a); 2001-424, s. 12.2(b); 2003-229, s. 9.)

§ 113A-118. Permit required.

(a) After the date designated by the Secretary pursuant to G.S. 113A-125, every person before undertaking any development in any area of environmental concern shall obtain (in addition to any other required State or local permit) a permit pursuant to the provisions of this Part.

(b) Under the expedited procedure provided for by G.S. 113A-121, the permit shall be obtained from the appropriate city or county for any minor development; provided, that if the city or county has not developed an approved implementation and enforcement program, the permit shall be obtained from the Secretary.

(c) Permits shall be obtained from the Commission or its duly authorized agent.

(d) Within the meaning of this Part:

(1) A "major development" is any development which requires permission, licensing, approval, certification or authorization in any form from the Environmental Management Commission, the Department of Environmental Quality, the Department of Administration, the North Carolina Oil and Gas Commission, the North Carolina Pesticides Board, the North Carolina Sedimentation Control Board, or any federal agency or authority; or which occupies a land or water area in excess of 20 acres; or which contemplates drilling for or excavating natural resources on land or under water; or which occupies on a single parcel a structure or structures in excess of a ground area of 60,000 square feet.

(2) A "minor development" is any development other than a "major development."

(e) If, within the meaning of G.S. 113A-103(5)b3, the siting of any utility facility for the development, generation or transmission of energy is subject to regulation under this Article rather than by the State Utilities Commission or by other law, permits for such facilities shall be obtained from the Coastal Resources Commission rather than from the appropriate city or county.

(f) **The Secretary may issue special emergency permits under this Article.** These permits may only be issued in those extraordinary situations in which life or structural property is in imminent danger as a result of storms, sudden failure of man-made structures, or similar occurrence. These permits may carry any conditions necessary to protect the public interest, consistent with the emergency situation and the impact of the proposed development. If an application for an emergency permit includes work beyond that necessary to reduce imminent dangers to life or property, the emergency permit shall be limited to that development reasonably necessary to reduce the imminent danger; all further development shall be considered under ordinary permit procedures. This emergency permit authority of the Secretary shall extend to all development in areas of environmental concern, whether major or minor development, and the mandatory notice

provisions of G.S. 113A-119(b) shall not apply to these emergency permits. To the extent feasible, these emergency permits shall be coordinated with any emergency permits required under G.S. 113-229(e1). The fees associated with any permit issued pursuant to this subsection or rules adopted pursuant to this subsection shall be waived. (1973, c. 476, s. 128; c. 1282, ss. 23, 33; c. 1284, s. 1; 1975, c. 452, s. 5; 1977, c. 771, s. 4; 1979, c. 253, s. 5; 1981, c. 932, s. 2.1; 1983, c. 173; c. 518, s. 3; 1987, c. 827, s. 136; 1989, c. 727, s. 131; 1997-443, s. 11A.119(a); 2007-485, s. 5; 2012-143, s. 1(d); 2014-4, s. 4(c); 2015-241, s. 14.30(u).)

§ 150B-2. Definitions.

As used in this Chapter,

(1b) "Adopt" means to take final action to create, amend, or repeal a rule.

§ 150B-21.2. Procedure for adopting a permanent rule.

(a) Steps. - Before an agency adopts a permanent rule, the agency must comply with the requirements of G.S. 150B-19.1, and it must take the following actions:

- (1) Publish a notice of text in the North Carolina Register.
- (2) When required by G.S. 150B-21.4, prepare or obtain a fiscal note for the proposed rule.
- (3) Repealed by Session Laws 2003-229, s. 4, effective July 1, 2003.
- (4) When required by subsection (e) of this section, hold a public hearing on the proposed rule after publication of the proposed text of the rule.
- (5) Accept oral or written comments on the proposed rule as required by subsection (f) of this section.

(b) Repealed by Session Laws 2003-229, s. 4, effective July 1, 2003.

(c) Notice of Text. - A notice of the proposed text of a rule must include all of the following:

- (1) The text of the proposed rule, unless the rule is a readoption without substantive changes to the existing rule proposed in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.3A.
- (2) A short explanation of the reason for the proposed rule.
- (2a) A link to the agency's Web site containing the information required by G.S. 150B-19.1(c).
- (3) A citation to the law that gives the agency the authority to adopt the rule.
- (4) The proposed effective date of the rule.
- (5) The date, time, and place of any public hearing scheduled on the rule.
- (6) Instructions on how a person may demand a public hearing on a proposed rule if the notice does not schedule a public hearing on the proposed rule and subsection (e) of this section requires the agency to hold a public hearing on the proposed rule when requested to do so.
- (7) The period of time during which and the person within the agency to whom written comments may be submitted on the proposed rule.
- (8) If a fiscal note has been prepared for the rule, a statement that a copy of the fiscal note can be obtained from the agency.
- (9) Repealed by Session Laws 2013-143, s. 1, effective June 19, 2013.

(d) Mailing List. - An agency must maintain a mailing list of persons who have requested notice of rule making. When an agency publishes in the North Carolina Register a notice of text of a proposed rule, it must mail a copy of the notice or text to each person on the mailing list who has

requested notice on the subject matter described in the notice or the rule affected. An agency may charge an annual fee to each person on the agency's mailing list to cover copying and mailing costs.

(e) Hearing. - An agency must hold a public hearing on a rule it proposes to adopt if the agency publishes the text of the proposed rule in the North Carolina Register and the agency receives a written request for a public hearing on the proposed rule within 15 days after the notice of text is published. The agency must accept comments at the public hearing on both the proposed rule and any fiscal note that has been prepared in connection with the proposed rule.

An agency may hold a public hearing on a proposed rule and fiscal note in other circumstances. When an agency is required to hold a public hearing on a proposed rule or decides to hold a public hearing on a proposed rule when it is not required to do so, the agency must publish in the North Carolina Register a notice of the date, time, and place of the public hearing. The hearing date of a public hearing held after the agency publishes notice of the hearing in the North Carolina Register must be at least 15 days after the date the notice is published. If notice of a public hearing has been published in the North Carolina Register and that public hearing has been cancelled, the agency shall publish notice in the North Carolina Register at least 15 days prior to the date of any rescheduled hearing.

(f) Comments. - An agency must accept comments on the text of a proposed rule that is published in the North Carolina Register and any fiscal note that has been prepared in connection with the proposed rule for at least 60 days after the text is published or until the date of any public hearing held on the proposed rule, whichever is longer. An agency must consider fully all written and oral comments received.

(g) Adoption. - An agency shall not adopt a rule until the time for commenting on the proposed text of the rule has elapsed and shall not adopt a rule if more than 12 months have elapsed since the end of the time for commenting on the proposed text of the rule. Prior to adoption, an agency shall review any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule and consider any public comments received in connection with the proposed rule or the fiscal note. An agency shall not adopt a rule that differs substantially from the text of a proposed rule published in the North Carolina Register unless the agency publishes the text of the proposed different rule in the North Carolina Register and accepts comments on the proposed different rule for the time set in subsection (f) of this section.

An adopted rule differs substantially from a proposed rule if it does one or more of the following:

- (1) Affects the interests of persons who, based on the proposed text of the rule published in the North Carolina Register, could not reasonably have determined that the rule would affect their interests.
- (2) Addresses a subject matter or an issue that is not addressed in the proposed text of the rule.
- (3) Produces an effect that could not reasonably have been expected based on the proposed text of the rule.

When an agency adopts a rule, it shall not take subsequent action on the rule without following the procedures in this Part. An agency must submit an adopted rule to the Rules Review Commission within 30 days of the agency's adoption of the rule.

(h) Explanation. - An agency must issue a concise written statement explaining why the agency adopted a rule if, within 15 days after the agency adopts the rule, a person asks the agency to do so. The explanation must state the principal reasons for and against adopting the rule and must discuss why the agency rejected any arguments made or considerations urged against the adoption of

the rule. The agency must issue the explanation within 15 days after receipt of the request for an explanation.

(i) Record. - An agency must keep a record of a rule-making proceeding. The record must include all written comments received, a transcript or recording of any public hearing held on the rule, any fiscal note that has been prepared for the rule, and any written explanation made by the agency for adopting the rule.

§ 150B-21.10. Commission action on permanent rule.

At the first meeting at which a permanent rule is before the Commission for review, the Commission must take one of the following actions:

- (1) Approve the rule, if the Commission determines that the rule meets the standards for review.
- (2) Object to the rule, if the Commission determines that the rule does not meet the standards for review.
- (3) Extend the period for reviewing the rule, if the Commission determines it needs additional information on the rule to be able to decide whether the rule meets the standards for review.

In reviewing a new rule or an amendment to an existing rule, the Commission may request an agency to make technical changes to the rule and may condition its approval of the rule on the agency's making the requested technical changes.

§ 150B-21.5. Circumstances when notice and rule-making hearing not required; circumstances when submission to the Commission not required.

(a) Amendment. - An agency is not required to publish a notice of text in the North Carolina Register, hold a public hearing, or submit the amended rule to the Commission for review when it proposes to amend a rule to do one of the following:

- (1) Reletter or renumber the rule or subparts of the rule.
- (2) Substitute one name for another when an organization or position is renamed.
- (3) Correct a citation in the rule to another rule or law when the citation has become inaccurate since the rule was adopted because of the repeal or renumbering of the cited rule or law.
- (4) Change information that is readily available to the public, such as an address, email address, a telephone number, or a Web site.
- (5) Correct a typographical error.
- (6) Repealed by Session Laws 2019-140, s. 1(a), effective July 19, 2019.

(a1) Response to Commission. - An agency is not required to publish a notice of text in the North Carolina Register or hold a public hearing when it proposes to change the rule in response to a request or an objection by the Commission, unless the Commission determines that the change is substantial.

