

To: Rules Review Commission  
From: William W. Peaslee, RRC counsel  
Date: September 12, 2024  
Re: 12 NCAC 10B .1302 amendment

The above captioned rule is to be reviewed by the Rules Review Commission (“RRC”) at its September 2024 meeting. On August 20, 2024, staff issued an opinion recommending objection to the above captioned rule pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(4) for failure to adopt the rule in accordance with Part 2 of Article 2 of the Administrative Procedures Act (APA.) Specifically, the Sheriff’s Education and Training Standard’s Commission (“Commission”) did not file the rule with the RRC within 30 days of adoption pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.2(g).

The Commission met on September 5, 2024, “readopted” the rule and submitted it to the RRC, presumably in anticipation of an objection by the RRC. The Commission avers that this subsequent “readoption,” and submission for review within 30 days of adoption, cures any previous failure to comply with the APA.

However, pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.2(g), when an agency adopts a rule, “it shall not take subsequent action on the rule without following the procedures in [the APA.]” Here, the Commission’s September 5, 2024 action is, arguably, a subsequent action notwithstanding the Commission adopting and submitting the same language.

It should be noted that the RRC has not yet objected to the original rule, therefore an attempt to satisfy the Commission’s anticipated objection is pre-mature. Further, if permitted, allowing agencies to re-adopt and re-submit to satisfy G.S. 150B-21.2(g) makes the requirement to file within 30 days of adoption a hollow requirement.

We can only speculate as to why the legislature included the “file within 30 days” requirement and what injury it was designed to prevent; however, presumably it was to manage the public’s expectations and provide notice of approximately when the RRC would review the rule post-adoption. For example, no one would expect a rule to be reviewed by the RRC years after adoption. Only the most astute members of the public would know when to comment to the RRC.

G.S. 150B-18 states that “a rule is not valid unless it is adopted in substantial compliance with [Article 2A.]”

The central question is whether the Commission substantially complied with the APA. As for the March 22, 2024 adoption, it is clear by its nearly four month delay in filing that it has not.

Whether the Commission’s subsequent adoption and filing on September 5, 2024 is substantially compliant and satisfies concerns about the notice to the public is a question best considered by the RRC members in the absence of counsel’s advice; however, in staff’s opinion that issue should be considered at the next RRC meeting, after objection at the September meeting. As an added benefit, the delay would provide more notice to the public of the RRC’s consideration of the rule.

To be clear, staff continues to recommend objection pursuant to G.S. 150B-21.9(a)(4) at this time for the reasons stated in the August 20, 2024 staff opinion.

**§ 150B-18. Scope and effect.**

This Article applies to an agency's exercise of its authority to adopt a rule. A rule is not valid unless it is adopted in substantial compliance with this Article. An agency shall not seek to implement or enforce against any person a policy, guideline, or other interpretive statement that meets the definition of a rule contained in G.S. 150B-2(8a) if the policy, guideline, or other interpretive statement has not been adopted as a rule in accordance with this Article. (1991, c. 418, s. 1; 2011-398, s. 1; 2012-187, s. 2.)

**§ 150B-21.2. Procedure for adopting a permanent rule.**

(a) Steps. - Before an agency adopts a permanent rule, the agency must comply with the requirements of G.S. 150B-19.1, and it must take the following actions:

- (1) Publish a notice of text in the North Carolina Register.
- (2) When required by G.S. 150B-21.4, prepare or obtain a fiscal note for the proposed rule.
- (3) Repealed by Session Laws 2003-229, s. 4, effective July 1, 2003.
- (4) When required by subsection (e) of this section, hold a public hearing on the proposed rule after publication of the proposed text of the rule.
- (5) Accept oral or written comments on the proposed rule as required by subsection (f) of this section.

(b) Repealed by Session Laws 2003-229, s. 4, effective July 1, 2003.

(c) Notice of Text. - A notice of the proposed text of a rule must include all of the following:

- (1) The text of the proposed rule, unless the rule is a readoption without substantive changes to the existing rule proposed in accordance with G.S. 150B-21.3A.
- (2) A short explanation of the reason for the proposed rule.
- (2a) A link to the agency's website containing the information required by G.S. 150B-19.1(c).
- (3) A citation to the law that gives the agency the authority to adopt the rule.
- (4) The proposed effective date of the rule.
- (5) The date, time, and place of any public hearing scheduled on the rule.
- (6) Instructions on how a person may demand a public hearing on a proposed rule if the notice does not schedule a public hearing on the proposed rule and subsection (e) of this section requires the agency to hold a public hearing on the proposed rule when requested to do so.
- (7) The (i) period of time during which and (ii) person within the agency to whom written comments may be submitted on the proposed rule.
- (8) If a fiscal note has been prepared for the rule, a statement that a copy of the fiscal note can be obtained from the agency.
- (9) Repealed by Session Laws 2013-143, s. 1, effective June 19, 2013.

(d) Mailing List. - An agency must maintain a mailing list of persons that have requested notice of rulemaking. When an agency publishes in the North Carolina Register a notice of text of a proposed rule, it must mail a copy of the notice of text to each person on the mailing list that has requested notice on the subject matter described in the notice or the rule affected. An agency may charge an annual fee to each person on the agency's mailing list to cover copying and mailing costs.

(e) Hearing. - An agency must hold a public hearing on a rule it proposes to adopt if the agency publishes the text of the proposed rule in the North Carolina Register and the agency receives a written request for a public hearing on the proposed rule within 15 days after the notice of text is published. The agency must accept comments at the public hearing on both the proposed rule and any fiscal note that has been prepared in connection with the proposed rule.

An agency may hold a public hearing on a proposed rule and fiscal note in other circumstances. When an agency is required to hold a public hearing on a proposed rule or decides to hold a public hearing on a proposed rule when it is not required to do so, the agency must publish in the North Carolina Register a notice of the date, time, and place of the public hearing. The hearing date of a public hearing held after the agency publishes notice of the hearing in the North Carolina Register

must be at least 15 but not later than 60 days after the date the notice is published. If notice of a public hearing has been published in the North Carolina Register and that public hearing has been cancelled, the agency must publish notice in the North Carolina Register at least 15 days prior to the date of any rescheduled hearing.

(f) Comments. - An agency must accept comments on the text of a proposed rule that is published in the North Carolina Register and any fiscal note that has been prepared in connection with the proposed rule for at least 60 days after the text is published or until the date of any public hearing held on the proposed rule, whichever is longer. An agency must consider fully all written and oral comments received.

(g) Adoption. - An agency shall not adopt a rule until the time for commenting on the proposed text of the rule has elapsed and shall not adopt a rule if more than 12 months have elapsed since the end of the time for commenting on the proposed text of the rule. Prior to adoption, an agency must review any fiscal note that has been prepared for the proposed rule and consider any public comments received in connection with the proposed rule or the fiscal note. An agency shall not adopt a rule that differs substantially from the text of a proposed rule published in the North Carolina Register unless the agency publishes the text of the proposed different rule in the North Carolina Register and accepts comments on the proposed different rule for the time set in subsection (f) of this section.

An adopted rule differs substantially from a proposed rule if it does one or more of the following:

- (1) Affects the interests of persons that, based on the proposed text of the rule published in the North Carolina Register, could not reasonably have determined that the rule would affect their interests.
- (2) Addresses a subject matter or an issue that is not addressed in the proposed text of the rule.
- (3) Produces an effect that could not reasonably have been expected based on the proposed text of the rule.

When an agency adopts a rule, it shall not take subsequent action on the rule without following the procedures in this Part. An agency must submit an adopted rule to the Rules Review Commission within 30 days of the agency's adoption of the rule.

(h) Explanation. - An agency must issue a concise written statement explaining why the agency adopted a rule if, within 15 days after the agency adopts the rule, a person asks the agency to do so. The explanation must state the principal reasons for and against adopting the rule and must discuss why the agency rejected any arguments made or considerations urged against the adoption of the rule. The agency must issue the explanation within 15 days after receipt of the request for an explanation.

(i) Record. - An agency must keep a record of a rulemaking proceeding. The record must include all written comments received, a transcript or recording of any public hearing held on the rule, any fiscal note that has been prepared for the rule, and any written explanation made by the agency for adopting the rule. (1973, c. 1331, s. 1; 1975, 2nd Sess., c. 983, s. 63; 1977, c. 915, s. 2; 1983, c. 927, ss. 3, 7; 1985, c. 746, s. 1; 1985 (Reg. Sess., 1986), c. 1022, s. 1(1), (7); 1987, c. 285, ss. 7-9; 1989, c. 5, s. 1; 1991, c. 418, s. 1; 1995, c. 507, s. 27.8(d); 1996, 2nd Ex. Sess., c. 18, s. 7.10(e); 2003-229, s. 4; 2011-398, s. 5; 2013-143, s. 1; 2013-413, s. 3(a); 2021-88, s. 17; 2023-134, s. 21.2(b).)